

The *Viṣamapadavyākhyā*: Nāgeśabhaṭṭa's Commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*

James Benson

The *Viṣamapadavyākhyā* (VP) is a short commentary directed to the "difficult" (*viśama*) passages in the first nine *āhnikas* (daily lessons) of Bhaṭṭoji Dīkṣita's *Śabdakaustubha*. The text appears to have been written by Nāgeśabhaṭṭa, and as far as I know has never been published. I am currently engaged in the preparation of a critical edition of the text based on 18 manuscripts currently held in libraries in Nepal, Jammu, Tamil Nadu, Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan, Kerala, and England. What follow here is a brief account of the text, its manuscript sources, and a preliminary version of the first *āhnika*.

The *Śabdakaustubha* and its Commentaries

The *Śabdakaustubha* is one of four grammatical texts known to have been written by Bhaṭṭoji Dīkṣita.¹ The other three are:

- 1) the *Siddhāntakaumudī*, a commentary on the *sūtras* of Pāṇini's *Aṣṭādhyāyī* in which these have been re-ordered so as to present in distinct chapters (*prakaraṇas*) various topics such as the names and principles used in grammar, the rules of *sandhi*, the derivation and inflexion of word classes, etc.,
- 2) the *Praudhamanoramā*, an autocommentary on the *Siddhāntakaumudī*, and
- 3) the *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntakārikā*, a set of approximately 72 verses, many taken from Bhartrhari's *Vākyapadīya*, which present in outline what is sometimes called the "philosophy of grammar".

The overall structure of the *Śabdakaustubha* is based on Patañjali's *Mahābhāṣya*, in that it follows the division of that text into *āhnikas*, the first two being directed to preliminary questions such as the purpose and definition of grammar (*paspaśāhnika*), and the system of sounds with which the grammar operates (*pratyāhārāhnika*). Unlike the *Mahābhāṣya* however, the *Śabdakaustubha* does not skip over certain *sūtras* of Pāṇini, but comments on every one which falls in the portions it covers. Moreover, and in further contrast with the *Mahābhāṣya*, it begins

¹ The dates of Bhaṭṭoji Dīkṣita are uncertain, but the period of his literary activity is commonly thought to be about 1580 to 1630. See Suryakant Bali, *Bhaṭṭoji Dīkṣita: His Contribution to Sanskrit Grammar*, pp. 3-4. Nāgeśabhaṭṭa, also known as Nāgojibhaṭṭa, was a prolific writer, not only in grammar, but in *dharmasāstra*, poetics, and other subjects as well. P.V. Kane dates the period of his literary activity from 1700 to 1750 in *History of Dharmasāstra*, Vol. I, Part II, pp. 965-7. See also P.K. Gode, "The Relative Chronology of some Works of Nāgojibhaṭṭa Between c. A.D. 1680 and 1750", in *Studies in Indian Literary History*, Vol. III, pp. 212-9.

its analysis of each *sūtra* with a basic account of what the *sūtra* teaches, before launching into an exposition of the various interpretive issues raised in the tradition. It is not known if the *Śabdakaustubha* was ever complete. The surviving portions which we know of cover *adhyāyas* I, II, and IV, and *pādas* 1-2 of *adhyāya* III. In 1803 Colebrooke had access to less of the text:

"The only portion of it I have yet seen reaches no farther than to the end of the first section of Pāṇini's first lecture. But this is so diffusive, that, if the whole have been executed on a similar plan, it must triple the ponderous volume of the *Mahābhāṣya* itself. I have reason, however, for doubting that it was ever completed".¹

Presumably it was the exhaustive treatment of grammatical topics in the *Śabdakaustubha* that led Bhaṭṭoji in his other works to refer readers to that text for more detailed discussion.²

The VP was one of a number of commentaries written on the *Śabdakaustubha*, none of which have yet been printed. It is difficult to know from published catalogues and reports just how many distinct commentaries have survived. Apart from the VP, Aufrecht lists the following by name of text or author:³

1. *Prabhā*, by Vaidyanātha Pāyagunḍe, pupil of Nāgeśabhaṭṭa
2. *Prabhā*, by Rāghavendrācārya
3. *Bhāvapradīpa* (or ° *dīpikā*), by Kṛṣṇamitra⁴
4. *Śabdakaustubhoddyota*, by Vaiyanātha Śukla
5. *Śabdakaustubhadūṣaṇa*, by Bhāskara Dīkṣita
6. Commentary, by Kṛṣṇācārya.⁵

¹ H.T. Colebrooke, "On the *Sanscrit* and *Pracrit* Languages", *Asiatic Researches*, vol. vii, 1801, pp. 199-231; reprinted in *Essays on the History, Literature, and Religions of Ancient India (Miscellaneous Essays)*, p. 13. The ratio of 3:1 mentioned by Colebrooke seems to lessen beyond the first *pāda* of the first *adhyāya*. Judging merely from page numbers, the greater density of commentary drops by about a quarter over the remaining part of the text.

² *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇasāra*, v. 1:

*phaṇibhāṣitaḥṣyābdheḥ śabdakaustubha uddhṛtaḥ/
tatra nirṇīta evā 'rthaḥ sākṣepeṇ 'ha kathyate//*,

and *Siddhāntakaumudī*, one of the concluding verses to the *uttarārdha*:

*itthā laukikaśabdānām diṇmātram iha darśitam/
vistaras tu yathāśāstrā darśitaḥ śabdakaustubhe//*.

³ T. Aufrecht, *Catalogus Catalogorum*, Part I, p. 632, Part II, p.150.

⁴ This author is identified as Kṛṣṇamiśra Bhaṭṭācārya by V. Krishnamacharya in the *Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Adyar Library*, p. 35.

⁵ Our sole reference for this work is G. Bühler's catalogue (see below). Possibly it is the same as number 3, since the author of that work is given as Kṛṣṇamitra Ācārya by the editor of Oudh X, 8, and as Kṛṣṇamiśra Bhaṭṭācārya by V. Krishnamacharya

He also gives these entries for otherwise unidentified commentaries on the *Śabdakaustubha*:

1. Bhr. 192. Oppert 2051. II, 2243.¹
2. Stein 47 (three different commentaries).²

Another commentary, which would be particularly interesting to find, is the *Prakāśa* by Haridīkṣita, the grandson of Bhaṭṭoḥji and teacher of Nāgeśabhaṭṭa. Haridīkṣita refers to this work in his *Śabdaratna* commentary on Bhaṭṭoḥji's *Praudhamanoramā*, but to my knowledge no surviving copies have been identified.³

The *Viṣamapadavyākhyā* and its Authorship

In 1872 G. Bühler recorded the existence in Bhuj of a commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha* written by Nāgojibhaṭṭa and having the name *Viṣamā*. By the end of the century, four more manuscripts were located, in Nagpur, Benares, Allahabad district, and Partābgarh (Maharashtra), all of which Aufrecht listed under the name *Viṣamapadī* and as being by Nāgeśa. The particular names of the text and the author as recorded in the catalogues used by Aufrecht are:

in the Adyar catalogue. Against this identification is of course the fact that Bühler lists these works as distinct.

¹ The first of these is listed in Shridhar Bhandarkar, *A Catalogue of the Collections of Manuscripts deposited in the Deccan College*, Bombay, 1888, p. 257, Section XV (manuscripts collected in 1882-3), no. 192. It is described there as an anonymous commentary on the first *pāda* of the *Śabdakaustubha* in 30 leaves, dated *saṃvat* 1850. In fact it is the manuscript of the VP currently held in the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute and described below as manuscript B. The second and third are listed as *Śabdakaustubhavyākhyā* and *Kaustubhavyākhyā*, with 302 and 222 pages respectively, in G. Oppert, *Lists of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Private Libraries in Southern India*, Madras, 1880, 1885.

² In his *Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts of His Highness the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir*, p. 47, M.A. Stein lists four manuscripts of *Śabdakaustubha* commentaries which lack names of the text or the author. The first two, numbers 73 and 71, are listed as *ṭīkās* and are manuscripts of the VP (they are manuscripts W and J described below). The third and fourth, numbers 70 and 74, are a *vyākhyā* of 41 folios and a *vyākhyānam* of 40 folios. Stein says that these are distinct from each other and from 73. He also lists a manuscript of Kṛṣṇamitra's *Bhāvapradīpa* (number 72).

³ *Praudhamanoramā with Commentary Śabdaratna*, ed. Venkatesh Laxman Joshi, p. 83.

<i>Viṣamā</i>	Nāgojibhaṭṭa	Bhuj ¹
<i>Viṣamapadī</i>	Nāgojibhaṭṭa	Nagpur ²
<i>Śabdakaustubhaṭīkā</i>	Nāgeśa	Benares ³
<i>Viṣamavyākhyā</i>	Nāgojibhaṭṭa	Allahabad district ⁴
<i>Viṣamatippaṇa</i>	Nāgeśa	Partābgarh ⁵

Unfortunately, none of the five reports referred to above quote any portion of the text. At present it is not known where any of these manuscripts are, if they still exist. A sixth report, not included in Aufrecht, listed a *Viṣamapadī* commentary by Nāgeśa in Alwar, but the manuscript itself does not bear the name of any author.⁶

In the 20th century, several manuscripts proving to be of a single commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha* were identified, a number having names identical or similar to those given in the catalogues used by Aufrecht: *Viṣamapadavyākhyā*, *Viṣamavyākhyā*, *Śabdakaustubhavyākhyā*, *Śabdakaustubhaṭīpaṇī*, *Śabdakaustubhatātparyaṭīkā*. The commentary given in these manuscripts is the same as the one given in three of Aufrecht's unidentified works listed above, namely, Bhr. 192 and two of the manuscripts in the Stein catalogue, and in the manuscript recorded from Alwar. However, none of these manuscripts contain any statement of authorship. It is reasonable to suspect that the 19th and the 20th century manuscripts are of one and the same text, but at present the old reports simply serve to suggest that the manuscripts we possess may be of a text by Nāgeśa.⁷ In his famous *Systems of Sanskrit Grammar*, published in 1915, Belvalkar says that Nāgeśa wrote a

¹ G. Bühler, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Contained in the Private Libraries of Gujarāt, Kāthivād, Kachchh, Sindh, and Khāndeś*, Fascicle III, pp. 22-3.

² F. Kielhorn, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit MSS. Existing in the Central Provinces*, pp. 88-9.

³ *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Private Libraries of the North-Western Provinces*, Part II (sic, for Part I), pp. 110-111.

⁴ Paṇḍita Devīprasāda, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1888*, pp. 84-5.

⁵ Paṇḍita Devīprasāda, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1889*, pp. 66-7. Aufrecht also lists one more manuscript, Oudh IX, 11, but I have not been able to find it in any catalogue volume.

⁶ P. Peterson, *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Alwar*, 1892, p. 51. The manuscript in question is manuscript C of the VP described below.

⁷ It is possible that not all of the five manuscripts of the VP listed by Aufrecht actually bore the name of the author, since one or more of the compilers may have relied on an earlier report and simply added Nāgeśa's name. (I confess I do not know what their practice was). In any case it seems that Peterson may have done this in his Alwar catalogue. It is perhaps less likely to have occurred in the case of the Benares manuscript, since the only name of the text given there, *Śabdakaustubhaṭīkā*, does not include the readily identifiable term "*viṣama*".

commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha* called the *Viṣamī*,¹ but clearly he had not examined any manuscript with Nāgeśa's name on it, since later, in his catalogue of the Bhandarkar manuscripts he only guesses that the Poona manuscript is "probably the same".² More recent authors either quote Belvalkar or refer to his likely source, Aufrecht.³ In the files of the *New Catalogus Catalogorum* it seems that any doubts have been set aside, and the 19th and 20th century manuscripts are assembled together as constituting our evidence for the *Viṣamavyākhyā*, a commentary by Nāgeśa on the *Śabdakaustubha*. It is this work which is edited here.⁴

It appears to me likely that this work was written by Nāgeśa, on grounds which will be presented below, but there are at least two reasons why we might be initially hesitant to assign it to him. Firstly, as was pointed out above none of the manuscripts we possess offer any statement of authorship. The word "*viṣama*", although fairly rare in the titles of Sanskrit commentaries (see below), may have occurred in more than one commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*. There are at least two different commentaries on the *Śabdakaustubha* called *Prabhā*. Secondly, even if the manuscripts we possess are of the same text as those which bear the name of Nāgeśa, it may not be the case that he was in fact the author. Apart from the entries in manuscript catalogues discussed above, no references have been reported from Sanskrit sources regarding either the *Viṣama* or a commentary of any other name by Nāgeśa on the *Śabdakaustubha*. It is well known that Nāgeśa occasionally refers readers to his other books by name, and that when he simply says a subject has been treated elsewhere, his pupil Vaidyanātha Pāyagunḍe often identifies which of his books is to be understood. In the absence of any direct reference to the VP as a work of Nāgeśa, it would not be unreasonable to suppose that the work could have been written by a direct or indirect pupil and then attributed to him.

Reasons for assuming that Nāgeśa did write the VP are the following. Firstly, a number of passages in the VP are strikingly similar or even identical to passages in other works by Nāgeśa. These are discussed briefly below. Secondly, in his *Prabhā* commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*, Nāgeśa's direct pupil Vaidyanātha Pāyagunḍe

¹ S.K. Belvalkar, *Systems of Sanskrit Grammar*, p. 41.

² S.K. Belvalkar, *Descriptive Catalogue of the Government Collections of Manuscripts deposited at the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Volume II, Grammar: Part I (Vedic & Pāṇinīya)*, p. 69.

³ E.g., V. Krishnamacharya, *Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Adyar Library, Vol. VI- Grammar, Prosody and Lexicography*, p. 37.

⁴ I must thank Dr. N. Gangadharan for very kindly sending me his list of manuscripts of Nāgeśa's commentary from the files of the *New Catalogus Catalogorum* in Madras. Under the printed entry for Nāgeśabhaṭṭa in this catalogue (Vol. X, p. 21b), the text is listed as the *Viṣamī*. It seems that there is one manuscript of the VP listed in the catalogue of the Punjab University Library (Lahore) as being by Nāgeśa (see appendix), but as anonymous in the files of the *New Catalogus Catalogorum*. I have not seen it, and so cannot be certain that it is of the same text as the others or that Nāgeśa's name is actually in it. In any case it seems remarkable that none of the eighteen manuscripts which I have seen bears an author's name.

incorporates, verbatim or very nearly verbatim, a very great deal of the corresponding text of the VP. The *Prabhā* is a much wordier commentary than the VP. Its treatment of the *Śabdakaustubha* is approximately nine times longer than the corresponding section of the VP.¹ It seems far more likely that Vaidyanātha included text from the VP in his much larger work, than that certain sentences were extracted from the *Prabhā* and incorporated in a separate composition, either by Vaidyanātha himself or by someone else. Also, Vaidyanātha never attributes the remarks found in the VP to his teacher or to any other scholar. They are not added to bolster or prove arguments, but rather form part of the basic exposition. It appears that Vaidyanātha wrote his commentary using the VP as one of his main sources, which makes perfect sense if the VP is the work of his teacher. It is of course possible that Vaidyanātha composed the VP himself, before writing the *Prabhā*, but in that case the many instances where the text of the VP fails to occur in the much larger work would be puzzling. Thirdly, Nāgeśa wrote at least one other book which was described in its colophon as "*viṣamapadavyākhyārūpa*" (having the form of a commentary on the difficult passages). This was one of his works on poetics, namely, the *Ṣaṭpadānanda* commentary on Appayadikṣita's *Kuvalayānanda*. The *Ṣaṭpadānanda* is one of two commentaries Nāgeśa wrote on the *Kuvalayānanda*, the *Alamkārasudhā* being the other. The *Ṣaṭpadānanda* is the shorter work, and its existence is at least indirectly suggestive that the grammatical work with a similar title could be by Nāgeśa.²

A more general consideration concerning Nāgeśa's authorship of the VP is whether it is likely to be something he would have written. This is of course impossible to argue strongly about, especially given the wide range of books Nāgeśa wrote, both on grammar and other topics. Still, he wrote two major commentaries on Bhaṭṭoji's *Siddhāntakaumudī*, namely, the *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara* and the *Laghuśabdenduśekhara*, and another on the *Praudhāmanoramā*, namely, the *Laghuśabdaratna*, and so it is plausible that he might have also written a commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*. It is also plausible that it might have been a short one, for the following reason. A great deal of the *Śabdakaustubha* is directed to Patañjali's *Mahābhāṣya* and Kaiyaṭa's *Pradīpa* commentary on it, and the statements of these

¹ It is not known how much of the *Śabdakaustubha* the *Prabhā* covered. The longest portion known to have survived is held in the India Office Library, where the text continues through the seventh *āhnika*.

² Manuscripts of this work are described in H. Śāstrī and S.C. Gui's *Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of the Calcutta Sanskrit College*, Vol. VII (no. 28), M.A. Stein's *Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts of His Highness the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir*, pp. 62 and 271 (no. 213), and F. Kielhorn's *A Catalogue of Sanskrit MSS Existing in the Central Provinces*, pp. 104-105. The colophons in the Calcutta and the Jammu manuscripts read: *iti śrikālopanāmakānāgeśabhāṭṭaviracitaḥ* (ḥ om. in Calcutta ms) *kuvalayānandīyaviṣamapadavyākhyārūpaḥ ṣaṭpadānandākhyo graṁthaḥ samāptaḥ*. The editors of the Calcutta catalogue say of the text, "A short commentary on the K, explaining only difficult words and passages." Kielhorn lists the text as, "*Viṣamapadī Kuvalayānandaṭīkā*", by Nāgeśabhaṭṭa.

writers were exactly the focus of Nāgeśa's remarks in his *Uddyota* commentary on the *Pradīpa*. We have good reason to suppose that Nāgeśa had the *Śabdakaustubha* in mind when writing the *Uddyota*, since his pupil Vaidyanātha constantly tells us in his *Chāyā* commentary on the *Uddyota* which grammarian or text his teacher is refuting, or, less often, supporting. The *Śabdakaustubha* is the name mentioned more than any other. Consequently, it would not be surprising if Nāgeśa also wrote a "brief but concise" commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*, as Belvalkar described the VP in his catalogue.¹

Lastly, the number and geographical spread of the known manuscripts of the VP suggest that it was a valued work.² Nāgeśa was famous as a scholar, and if the VP are his notes on the *Śabdakaustubha*, it makes sense that manuscripts would have travelled widely. Also, as will be seen in the edition, there are significant textual variants, showing that the work was revised either by the author or, I think less likely, by a later scholar. The dissemination and survival of earlier and later drafts is also consistent with Nāgeśa's authorship, in the sense that he was a prolific writer who was known to revise his works, and according to tradition he lived to an old age.

Introductory and Concluding Verses in the MSS

Only a single manuscript of the VP gives an introductory verse, and there it is added in the margin in a second hand. The deity saluted is Śiva, as in Nāgeśa's other works, but no name is offered for the text apart from the plain term "*kaustubhavyākhyā*" (commentary on the *Kaustubha*). The verse suggests that the work was possibly not intended for the use of beginners, since it announces that the author wrote it, "to delight persons of judgement" (*saṃkhyāvatām mude*).

It is perhaps interesting to note that in the printed extract of Nāgeśa's *Ṣaṭpadānanda* commentary in the Jammu catalogue no introductory verses appear. Of course this only reflects the state of the one manuscript, but it may suggest that in this particular genre of commentary by Nāgeśa introductory verses were not necessary or expected.

A related feature which the VP shares with the *Ṣaṭpadānanda* is that it concludes without any final verse. It is curious though that there appears in the colophons of a group of manuscripts (RTCUSJ) a verse which also occurs in manuscripts of the *Śabdakaustubha* itself. This verse is somewhat famous, since it honors Śeṣakṛṣṇa, author of numerous works, including the *Prasāda* commentary on Rāmacandra's *Prakriyākaumudī*, for teaching the author grammar:

*nirviśeṣaṃ mahāśeṣāc cheṣakṛṣṇaṃ ahaṃ bhaje/
yo mām aśeṣāḥ śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat||*

¹ Op. cit., p. 69.

² Apart from the localities mentioned above, it appears from catalogue reports that manuscripts of the text are held in Benares and Patna. See appendix.

(I honor Śeṣakṛṣṇa, no different from the great Śeṣa (i.e., lord of snakes), who taught me in excellent fashion the entire doctrine of Śeṣa, (i.e., Patañjali)). The verse was brought to public attention by Mukunda Puṇatāmakara, who quotes it in his introduction to the *Śabdakaustubha* as occurring in an old manuscript of the *Śabdakaustubha* in the Sarvasvatībhavana Library.¹ I have also seen it recorded in an "old-appearing" Telegu manuscript of the *Śabdakaustubha* in the Madras Government Oriental Library.² It also appears in a manuscript of the *Śabdakaustubha* in the Chandra Shum Shere collection in the Bodleian Library.³

The VP and Nāgeśa's Other Works

A large number of passages in the VP are closely similar or even identical to passages found in Nāgeśa's other grammatical works, a fact which contributes to the arguments for accepting Nāgeśa's authorship. In the notes to the text many of these parallels have been pointed out, but there has been no attempt to do this exhaustively. Nāgeśa's writings are simply too voluminous to make this practical at present.

The text of Nāgeśa which seems to show the closest agreement with the VP is the Uddyota commentary on Kaiyaṭa's *Pradīpa*. This is hardly surprising, since the *Pradīpa* was an extremely important text for the later grammatical tradition, as is made clear by the numerous commentaries directed to it. Although the *Pradīpa* never had the authority of the *Mahābhāṣya* itself, scholars of Bhaṭṭoji's period seemed compelled to account for its teachings, either explaining or refuting them, when setting out their own interpretation of the ancient texts. I have not made a precise count of this, but Kaiyaṭa seems to be the most writer most referred to in the *Śabdakaustubha*.

A second text by Nāgeśa which shows close matches to passages in the VP is the *Sphoṭavāda*. The doctrine of *sphoṭa* is not a major theme in the *Pradīpa*, although that term is used and the relevant issue of denotation is discussed.⁴ Bhaṭṭoji devotes the second of his five sub-sections on the first *āhnikā* to this topic, and that is where most of the parallel passages in the VP occur.

A third text by Nāgeśa which the VP occasionally matches is the *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara*, a commentary on Bhaṭṭoji's *Praudhamanoramā*. I have not traced that many parallel passages, but one in particular is interesting, in light of the findings of the editor of the *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara*, Sitarāma Śāstrī. In his lengthy

¹ *Śabdakaustubha*, ed. Mukunda Puṇatāmakara, p. 1 of the Introduction. Puṇatāmakara does not say where the verse occurs.

² M. Rangacharya, *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras, Vol. III Grammar, Lexicography and Prosody*, No. 1324, p. 942. The verse is recorded as occurring at the end of the first *pāda* of the first *adhyāya*.

³ MS Chandra Shum Shere d.226, f. 309r. As in the Madras manuscript referred to above, the verse occurs at the end of the first *pāda* of the first *adhyāya*. I have not checked any other manuscripts of the *Śabdakaustubha*.

⁴ *Pradīpa*, p. 17b.

introduction to the text, Śāstrī argues that Nāgeśa constantly revised the *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara*, and at some point put together the *Laghuśabdenduśekhara* as a more condensed, final treatise on the *Praudhamanoramā*.¹ He argues that Nāgeśa changed his mind about the grammatical formation of the word "vidhi" in Pāṇini's rule 1.1.72 *yena vidhis tadantasya*, and that this change is evident from the manuscript tradition of the *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara*. The direction of change is clear given the evidence of the *Laghuśabdenduśekhara*. The issue in question is whether the word "vidhi" is formed as an action noun (the earlier view) or an object noun (the later view). Śāstrī's exposition of the material is of course important for our understanding of the *Śekhara* texts, but it is interesting to see that the VP matches exactly the older formulation. Still, it is not certain what Nāgeśa believed to be true when writing this passage in the VP, since he is simply explaining Bhaṭṭoji's view.

There are also certain distinctive phrases in the VP which are common to a number of Nāgeśa's works. One such phrase, *pratyayasyā 'ṅgāṃśa utthitākāṅkṣatvāt*, occurs in the VP on *Śabdakaustubha* 92.27. This expresses Nāgeśa's view on the natural expectancy a suffix has for an *aṅga*, something he refers to in nearly identical words in the *Uddyota* and the *Paribhāṣenduśekhara*.²

The absence (so far) of any textual references to the VP, along with the variety in readings found in the manuscripts, and the lack of a concluding colophon with the author's name, suggest that possibly Nāgeśa never finished it in a set form for dissemination. Perhaps the text we have are his notes on the *Śabdakaustubha* which he used when teaching that book. The *New Catalogus Catalogorum* lists 42 works by Nāgeśa on *dharmasāstra*, *alamkārasāstra*, grammar, and *tantra*, before adding 26 more "miscellaneous" works, stating that many of these may be part of his major works. The depth of Nāgeśa's scholarship is well known. Given the very size of his output, it is at least plausible that a final "authorized" form of the VP never left his pen, in the way that his more famous works did.

Manuscripts of the VP

Eighteen manuscripts have been used in preparing the edition. The scribal dates recorded in them range from 1755 to 1816, the sole exception to this being a transcription date of 1913-14. The only place name for copying given by a scribe is Kāśī (Benares). Manuscripts L and Y are in Malayalam script; all the others are in Devanāgarī.

O Oxford. Bodleian Library. MS Chandra Shum Shere d.848. 79 folios. 24 1/2 x 10 1/2 cm. 9 lines. Paper. Ff. 24-28 (at *hrasve 'ti* (92.5 or 3) to *samudāye iti* (110.31)) and 33-38 (at *cvipratyayasthale iti* (134.26) to *bahuvrīhitvam iti* (156.15)) missing; otherwise complete.

¹ *Bṛhacchabdenduśekhara*, ed. Sītārāmaśāstrī, Introduction, (second edition) pp. 41-2.

² E.g., in the *Uddyota* on Pāṇini 6.1.13 *ṣyaṅḥ samprasāraṇaṃ putrapatyos tatpuruṣe*, p. 34b, and the *Paribhāṣenduśekhara* on *paribhāṣā* 103 *anantyavikāre 'ntyasadeśasya*, p. 203.

Colophon: iti śrīnavamāhnikam samāptam || ||rāma (6x).

B Bhandarkar. Belvalkar, Shripad Krishna, *Descriptive Catalogue of the Government Collections of Manuscripts deposited at the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Insitute, Volume II, Grammar: Part I (Vedic and Pāṇinīya)*, Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1938, p. 68. No. 85. *Viṣama (pada) vyākhyā*. 192/1882-93. 30 folios. 10 x 6 in. 17 lines. 40 akṣaras. Country paper. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakausubhe viṣamapadavyākhyāyām navamam āhnikam || ||pādaś ca samāptaḥ || samvat 1850 tame varṣe bhādrapadamāse kṛṣṇapakṣe tṛtīyāyām ravivāsare dehāvalīsthahatṭopanāmakadevātmajena śivaśamkarākhyena likhiteyaṃ viṣamapadavyākhyā nāma śrīśabdakausubhasya tīkā ||. (*The date given here corresponds to Sunday, September 22nd, 1793*).

A Adyar. Pandit V. Krishnamacharya, *Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Adyar Library, Vol. VI- Grammar, Prosody and Lexicography*, The Adyar Library, Madras, 1947, p. 37. Number 137. *Śabdakaustubhāṭikā-Viṣamī*. 17 folios. 10 1/4 x 3 in. 8 lines. Paper. Old. Ends in passage on *jñāpakene 'ti* (101.13).

P Ānandāśrama, Pune. Library number 1055. 27 folios. 11 x 4 in. (this is judging from a xerox copy, and may be incorrect). 10 lines. *Viṣamavyākhyā* on f. 1r. Ends after the passage on *sa ca padārthe 'ti* (184.9).

Colophon: iti śivam || prathame pañcamaṃ || iti viṣamavyākhyā samāptā || idaṃ pustakam śake 1709 plavaṃganāmasamvatsare āṣāḍhe māsi śuklapakṣe caturthyām tithau caṃdravāsare |

lakṣmīr yasya virājate śucikule cāṃdrīva paṃkeruhe
yo gaṃgādharasūnur ekamatimān yo veṃkaṭeśākhyakaḥ |
nāmnopopapadena yaṃ yudhavarāḥ | śrīgoḍavolaṃ vidus
teneyaṃ likhitā śubhāstu viṣamavyākhyā śriyaḥ pritaye ||
etena śrīmahālakṣmīkṛṣṇādayaś trbhyaṃtām ||. (*The date given here is likely to be Monday, June 18th, 1787 (although the tithi corresponds to June 19th)*).

K Kathmandu National Archives. Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project. Reel No. E 1812/8. Running No. E 34676. 44 folios. 22.3 x 9.7 cm. 13-14 lines. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyām navamam āhnikam || pādaś ca samāptaḥ || || || samvat 1832 śake 1697 varṣe caitre māsi śuklapakṣe 9 ravivāsare kuramāṃcalāmtarvirājamānagaṃgāvalībhūmibhūṣaṇaśrautrārhamtīcaṇajanānivāsakṣe tra-grāmābhijanasītārāmabhaṭṭasūrisūnurāmanārāyaṇabhaṭṭena svahastena likhīdaṃ pustakam || ||

tailād rakṣej jalād rakṣed rakṣec chithilavaṃdhanāt

kaṣṭena likhitam gramtham yatnena paripālayet|1|. (*The date given here corresponds to Sunday, April 9th, 1775*).

N Kathmandu National Archives. Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project. MS No. 4-1684. Reel No. A 1201/4. 47 folios. 24.2 x 12 cm. 11 lines. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyāṃ navamam āhnikam||pādaś ca samāpta|| || || ||.

R Kathmandu National Archives. Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project. MS No. 5-3825. Reel No. A 1201/3. 53 folios. 11 lines. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyāṃ navamam āhnikam pādaś ca samāptaḥ

nirviśeṣam mahāśeṣāc cheṣakṛṣṇam aha bhaje
yo mām aśeṣāḥ šeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajogapat 1
likhitā rāmakṛṣṇena viṭṭalātmajasūnunā
kaustubhaviṣamavyākhyā kāśyāṃ ca daśamī dine 1|| ||cha||cha||cha.

I Kathmandu National Archives. Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project. MS No. 5-3825. Reel No. A 1201/3. The final six folios on the reel have been listed as the *Viṣamapadavyākhyā*, but only one folio side is of this text (the rest has not yet been identified, but seems to be the text of another *Śabdakaustubha* commentary). 12 lines. Ends in passage on *anyahetukam* (4.15).

M Madras. Government Oriental Manuscripts Library. Complete. S. Kuppuswamy Sastri, *A Triennial Catalogue of Manuscripts Collected During the Triennium 1913-14 to 1915-16 for the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras, Volume II.-Part 1.- Sanskrit A*, Madras, 1917, p. 1659. R. No. 1316. Paper. 54 folios. 11 x 8 7/8 in. 20 lines. Good. Transcribed in 1913-14 from a MS. of M.R. Ry. Nārāyaṇa-Śāstri of Tiruvadi. "The transcription of the original manuscript is said to have been completed on the 4th day of Āvaṇi (the Upākarma day of the Ṛgvedins falling on that day) in the year Āṅgirasa." *Śabdakautubhaṭippanī*. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhaṭippanyāṃ navamam āhnikam samāptam||
||saṃpūrṇo 'yaṃ granthaḥ||

sāhitīsauhītisaṃpat parimānasthirīkṛtā|
kṛtam yaṭ ṭippanam śabdakaustubhasyādīmasya tu||

(*then M has a Tamil sentence giving the information presented above in closed quotes*)

iti śabdakaustubhaṭippanī samāptā|| Transcribed from a palm leaf ms. of Narayana Sastrigal of Tiruvadi in 1913-14 (*then*) 10-6-13.

T Trivandrum. *A hand-list of the Sanskrit manuscripts acquired for the Travancore University Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum*. Number 7271. 46 folios. 10-14 lines. Paper. *Śabdakaustubhaviṣamavyākhyā*. Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyāṃ navamam āhnikam||pādaś ca samāptah|

nirviśeṣaṃ mahāśeṣāc cheṣakṛṣṇam ahaṃ bhaje
yo mām aśeṣāḥ śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat
śrīmadgurūṇāṃ vilasanmatīnāṃ prasādakartrī mayi sarvadāsā|
vilekhansyaiva kṛtīr mamaīśā bhūyān nṛsimhātmaṃjapūrvajasya||1|| || (*then about 22 akṣaras blackened*) śrīḥ (9x) śubham bhūyāt||śrīḥ||.

L Trivandrum. Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library. MS. No. 18861. Malayalam script. Palm-leaf. 216 sides (108 folios, each side marked with an Arabic numeral). 6 lines. Complete.

Colophon: cha|iti navamam āhnikam||saṃpūrṇṇo granthah||śrīrāmāya namaḥ||.

Y Trivandrum. Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library. MS. No. C. 1840. Malayalam script. Palm-leaf. 202 sides (101 folios, each side marked with an Arabic numeral). 6 lines. Complete.

Colophon: iti navamam ahnikam||saṃpūrṇṇo granthah||.

U Ujjain. *A Catalogue of Manuscripts in the Oriental Manuscripts Library (Prācyā Granthā Saṅgraha, now called Scindia Oriental Institute)*, Ujjain, Vol. II, 1941, p. 38. No. 4006. 37 folios. 24 x 11 cm. 8 lines. *Śabdakaustubhaviṣama*. F.36 ends in passage on *sup supe 'ti* (148.17) and f. 37 (last) continues in passage on *thañvidhāv iti* (292.1).

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyāṃ namamam āhnikam pādaś ca samāptah|

nirviśeṣaṃ mahāśeṣa cheṣakṛṣṇam ahaṃ bhaje|
yo mām aśeṣā śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat
śrīḥ likhitam idaṃ tāropanāmnā gaṃgārāmeṇeṇā nagojībhadaḥprāsādāt||saṃmata
1869. (*The date given here corresponds to 1812*).

S Ujjain. Ibid. No. 8682. 27 folios. 30 x 11 cm. 9 lines. 45 *akṣaras*. *Śabdakaustubhāṭīkāviṣamīnavamāhnikā*. Ff. 1-27, line 5 covers text into the passage on *sup supe 'ti* (148.17), and then continues with text in the passage on *thañvidhāv iti* (292.1).

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyāṃ namamam āhikam pādaś ca samāptah|

nirviśeṣaṃ mahāśeṣa cheṣakṛṣṇam ahaṃ bhaje|

yo mām aśeṣā śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat
śrīḥ likhitam idaṃ tāropanāmnā gaṃgārāmeṇeṇā nagojībhadaḥprāsādāt||saṃmata 1873
kāsā||cha||cha|| *flower design* || *flower design* ||cha||cha||. (*The date given here
corresponds to 1816*).

C Alwar. The Palace Library. Peterson, Peter, *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Alwar*, Bombay, 1892, p.51. No. 1185. *Vishamapadī* by Nagesa. 76 folios. 9 3/4 x 5 1/4 in. 9 lines. Complete. On f. 1r is written *Kaustubhanavamāhnikasya tīkā viṣamā* and the number 3196. The author's name is not recorded in the manuscript.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhe viṣamavyākhyāyām navamam āhnikam||
pādaś ca samāptaḥ||
nirviśeṣam mahāśeṣāc cheṣakṛṣṇam ahaṃ bhaje||
yo mām aśeṣāḥ śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat||
śrīrāmajīkṛṣṇāya namaḥ||rāma rā.
in another hand: sarakāra alavara.

E Pune. Deccan College. Handlist. Accession No. 2092.
Śabdakaustubhatātparyatīkā. Folios 1-25. 9.9 x 4.3 in. 9 lines. 42 *akṣaras*.
Accession. No. 10819. *Śabdakaustubhatātparyatīkāyām (viṣama^o)
prathamādhyāyasya prathamah pādah*. Folios 26-59. 8-10 lines. 34-44 letters.
Complete.

Colophon: iti śrīśabdakaustubhatātparyatīkāyām prathamādhyāyasya prathame pāde
navamam āhnikam|| ||pādaḥ sāmāptaḥ||raudranāmasaṃvatsare śrāvaṇamāse
śuklapakṣe pra tithau guruvāse (*perhaps corrected to vāre*) śrīkāśīkṣetre idaṃ
pustakam samāptim agamat|| ||*flower design*||. (*The date given here corresponds to
Thursday, July 23rd, 1789*).

J Jammu. Stein, M.A., *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Raghunath Temple Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir*, Bombay, 1894, p. 47. *Granthāṅkaḥ* 70. *Śabdakaustubhavyākhyā*. 41 folios. 10 lines. 55 *akṣaras*. Complete.

Colophon: nirviśeṣam mahāśeṣāc chaṣakṛṣṇam ahaṃ bhaje||
yo mām aśeṣāḥ śeṣoktīr viśiṣyaivādhyajīgapat||1||
iti śabdakaustubhavyākhyāyām navamam āhnikam||saṃvat 1841. (*The date given
here corresponds to 1784*).

W Jammu. Stein, M.A., *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Raghunath Temple Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir*, Bombay, 1894, p. 47. *Granthāṅkaḥ* 73. *Śabdakaustubhatīkā*. 65 folios. 10 lines. 34 *akṣaras*. Begins in passage on *kālavayavāyād iti* (31.26).

Colophon: iti navamam āhnikam pādaś ca prathamah samāptaḥ samvat 1812 mārgaśīrṣavadi 11 ravau. (*The date given here corresponds to Sunday, December 14, 1755*).

More details about the individual manuscripts and the relationships among them will be given in the edition. In general, the manuscripts fall into two groups: KNIRBTCA and PMLYUSEJ, with O and W frequently agreeing with one or the other of the two groups. Smaller groupings of closely related manuscripts are MLY, US, KNI, and BRTC. Manuscript W, one of two manuscripts from Jammu, is by far the most interesting witness, since it contains a large number of unique passages and corrected passages, many of the latter introducing readings of the K group, while the original text of W sides with the P group. It is the oldest of the dated manuscripts (1755), and could conceivably have been written during the lifetime of Nāgeśa. Unfortunately, the first four folios are lost, and the manuscript does not start until the second *āhnika*.

Use of Vaidyanātha's *Prabhā* for Editing the VP

Apart from the manuscripts of the VP, the most important source of information about the text comes from Vaidyanātha Pāyagunḍe's *Prabhā* commentary on the *Śabdakaustubha*. As stated above, Vaidyanātha was a direct pupil of Nāgeśa, and the *Prabhā* is a fairly dense commentary which incorporates a great deal of the VP. Vaidyanātha's commentaries on Nāgeśa's other grammatical texts are generally recognized as extremely valuable, and therefore the surviving portion of the *Prabhā* can I believe be of considerable use for the task of editing Nāgeśa's text. Very often the *Prabhā* has text which clearly matches an individual manuscript or a distinct group of manuscripts of the VP. It also happens, though much less frequently, that when the two large groups of manuscripts identified above offer distinct texts, the *Prabhā* contains both. On the whole, the *Prabhā* seems to agree more with the P group than the K group, when these differ, but with exceptions. It should be pointed out that in spite of the close correspondence between the VP and the *Prabhā*, there are many passages in the VP, recorded in all its manuscripts, which are either absent in the *Prabhā* or touch on subjects which are discussed there in language so slightly common to the VP that chance similarity seems the likely explanation. In any case, it should also be kept in mind that the *Prabhā* has not been edited. In the section presented below, I have regularly given references to two *Prabhā* manuscripts.

Manuscripts of Vaidyanātha's *Prabhā*

The manuscripts of the *Prabhā* which I have used are these:

L India Office, London. Eggeling, Julius, and others, *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of the India Office*, London, 1887-1935. San MS 650. 252 folios. 10-13 lines. The manuscript is a composite of separately numbered sections in different hands. Arabic numerals have been added at the top of

consecutive pairs of folio sides. Ends with the seventh āhnika. Page 241 (the end of āhnika 6) has the date: saṃvat 1847 śake 1711 jyeṣṭhaśuddha 11 śanau. (The saṃvat reckoning gives Monday, May 24th, 1790, but the corresponding śaka date should be 1712, not 1711).

N Kathmandu National Archives. Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project. MS No. 5-3825. Reel No. A 1201/3. 108 folios. 10-11 lines. First āhnika. MS No. 4-1684. Reel No. A 1201/4. 81 folios. 10 lines. Second āhnika.

The First *Āhnika*

The text of the first *āhnika* given below is relatively straightforward. As stated above, this portion is absent in W, and there is far less disagreement among the other manuscripts than is found in subsequent *āhnikas*. The *Prabhā* shows frequent agreement with manuscript O, when the latter offers passages of text not found in the other manuscripts of the VP. This particular type of agreement, where O or a group of manuscripts including O shares text with *Prabhā* not found in other manuscripts, can be seen in many places in the VP. It must be said, however, that there is also frequent disagreement between the *Prabhā* and O. As indicated above, the relation of Vaidyanātha's work with the manuscripts of the VP is rather complicated, and will be discussed in the edition.

References to the *Śabdakaustubha* given below are to the page and line numbers of the Chowkhamba text. References to the *Prabhā* are listed first to the Indian Office manuscript (L), and then to the manuscript from Nepal (N). For the first of these, pages numbers are followed by a reference to the top (t) or bottom (b) folio side, and then by the line number. For the second, folio numbers are distinctly marked only for the reverse side (v), not the obverse, before the line number is given.

Viṣamapadavyākhyā

Āhnika 1

¹{pitaraṃ vakratuṇḍasya vande ṣaḍvaktrajanmadam|
karomi kaustubhavyākhyām iha saṃkhyāvatāṃ mude||1||.}
viṣayam iti.² (1.12) viṣaye kathite tatpratirūpaprayojanam³ apy
uktaprāyam iti bhāvaḥ.⁴ prayojanam āhe 'ti kaiyaṭoktaṃ tu⁵ cintyam,
viṣayākathanena nyūnatvād iti dik.⁶

dyotaka iti.⁷ (13) idaṃ na sādhyam, anarthakanipātānām api darśanāt. kiṃ tu
vācakatvābhāva iti tad āha,

na tv iti. (14) prakṛte ca śabdānuśāsanapadasya lakṣaṇā,
prādisamabhivyāhāre⁸ jidhātoḥ prakṛṣṭajayādāv iva. kevalāprayogas⁹ tu prādivad
eṣām api.¹⁰ etena vācakapadasamabhivyāhārābhāvād athaśabdasya na¹¹ dyotakate 'ti
parāstam.

yad vā. śabdānuśāsanam¹² ity ukte¹³ vākyārthasamāptaye¹ kriyādhyāhāra
āvaśyakaḥ. tatrā 'niyatakriyādhyāhāre prasakte 'thaśabdena kriyāntaraṃ

¹ This verse occurs only in S, where it is written in the top margin.

² viṣayam iti om. in C.

³ tatpratirūpaprayojanam BMLYJ: tadutpatirūpaprayojanam S (corr. from tatpatirūpaprayojanam).

⁴ iti bhāvaḥ PMLYUSEJ: iti bhāvaḥ om. in OKNRIABTC.

⁵ tu OMLYEJ: tu om. in PKNABRITCUSG. Pradīpa, p. 5a.

⁶ °tvād iti dik PMLYUSEJ: °tvāt OKNABRITC.

⁷ dyotakā° MLY.

⁸ lakṣaṇā yadi sama° P.

⁹ kevala° NMLY.

¹⁰ eṣām iti E.

¹¹ na om. in A.

¹² In place of śabdānuśāsanam MLY have anuśāsanam.

¹³ ukter O.

vyavacchidya prārambharūpai 'vā 'tra kriyā² vivakṣyate. idam³ eva cā 'thaśabdasya⁴
dyotakatvaṃ nāme 'ti.⁵

sāmānye iti. (21) vyāpyadharmopasthitau vyāpakadharmopasthiter
āvaśyakatvād iti bhāvaḥ.

⁶{pramāṇam upasargāṇām dyotakatvasādhakam arthāpattirūpam. tasya
sāmānye nipātatte pakṣapātaḥ tadavacchedenai 'va dyotakatvaṃ sādhayatī 'ty arthaḥ.
akhaṇḍopādhyanaṅgikāra āha,

jātī 'ti. (22) tatra *puruṣānupavyāpakatāvachedakatayā* siddhavaijātyena
sāṅkaryād āha,⁷

śabdavarūpam eva ce 'ti. (23).

kevalānām iti. (2.1) asahāyānām aprayogene 'ti svatantraprayogābhāvene 'ty
arthaḥ. }

ṣaṣṭhī 'ti.⁸ (6) na ca samuccitābhidhānān niṣkṛṣṭasamuccayānabhidhānān na⁹
bhedanibandhanā ṣaṣṭhī' ti vācyam. tathā sati sattvavācītvād anipātattvād
anavyayatve vibhaktiḥ śrūyete 'ti bhāvaḥ.¹

¹ vākyārthaparīsamāptaye S.

² °rūpaiva kriyātra PML: °rūpeva kriyātra Y: °rūpaiva kriyā US.

³ iyam MLY.

⁴ evāthaśabdasya PMLY: eva athaśabdasya US.

⁵ dyotakatā nāmaiveti M: dyotakatā nameti LY.

⁶ pramāṇam *through* arthaḥ (*three passages down*) *only in O (partially in Prabhā 7t, 8 (N 9, 8)); pramāṇā upasargāṇām dyo (end of folio side) highlighted as if a pratīka.*

⁷ Cf. *Prabhā 7b, 4 (N 9v, 6): tattatpuruṣīyaprādinīṣṭhena vyāpakena kāraṇatāvachedakatādī (tādiva L) nā siddhena pratvādirūpavaijātyena sāṅkaryād āha.*

⁸ ghaṭādeḥ ṣaṣṭhīti MLYUSE.

⁹ na ca samuccayānabhidhānān na MLY: *in place of final* na E *has nātra.*

yathe 'ti.² (7) sundaraḥ samuccaya ityādau.³ nanu caśabdaśaktisvabhāvāt⁴
pacati pāka⁵ ityāder iva cādivācyasyā⁶ 'sattvabhūtatvam⁷ iti na vibhaktiśravaṇam.
samuccitābhidhānāc ca na bhedanibandhanā ṣaṣṭhī na vā⁸ viśeṣaṇayogo⁹ na vā¹⁰
vyutpattisaṃkoco 'ta āha,

api ce 'ti. (8).

bodhakatā 'pī 'ti.¹¹ (13) apinā sādṛśyasye 'vārthatve nāmārthayor
abhedānvaya ity asya saṃgrahaḥ.¹²

caturvidhe iti.¹³ (22) nāmākhyātopasarganipātarūpe ity arthaḥ.

¹⁴{**nañāḥ paryudāse 'ti.** (28) abrāhmaṇa ityādau. }

anupādānād iti.¹ (3.14) prayojanābhāvād iti bhāvaḥ.²

¹ śrūyeta PMLYUSE; *then* US *have* syāc ceti (2.5). dhavakhadirayoḥ samuccaya jhasighat ghavasya (hyasighat ghavasyā S) (=itivat dhavasya?) khadirasya cety eva syāt ity arthaḥ.

² yathā viśeṣaṇasaṃvadha ity US.

³ sūdaraḥ puruṣa ityādau P: sūdaraḥ samuccayo draṣṭavya ityādivat śobhanaś ca draṣṭavya ity asyāpy āpatti syāt US.

⁴ nanu śabdaśaktisvabhāvāt O: nanu śaktisvabhāvāt US: nanu caśabdaśaktisvarūpat N: *in* K bhāvāt *corrected from* rūpāt. *Prabhā* 9t, 8 (N 11v, 9) nanu śabda (śabdā N) śaktisvabhāvāt (*in a similar passage*).

⁵ pacati pācaka B.

⁶ °āder eva cādi° MLY: iva satvādi° I: iva tvādi° C.

⁷ satvam US: satvam tatvam O.

⁸ na cā N.

⁹ viśeṣeṇa yogo LY.

¹⁰ vā *om. in* Y.

¹¹ bodhajanakatāpīti PUS: bodhakatvāpīti LY: bodhakatve pīti M. PUS *matches* ŚK *ed.* Cf. *Prabhā* 10t, 1 (N 12v, 5) bodhakatāpīty (*followed by* apinā usrasadṛśasya).

¹² *Here* US *have* uttarapadārthādiprādhānyam iti (2.15). pūrvapadasyā 'narthakatvene 'tyādiḥ. idam upalakṣaṇam. upasargasyā 'rthavattvābhāvena prātipadikatvābhāvāt vibhaktisattā na syād iti.

¹³ caturvidhe pade ceti U: caturvidhe padeti S. *Prabhā* 11b, 9 (N 14v, 9) caturvide pade (*without* iti). *Tantravārtika at Jaiminisūtra* 1.3.33 (Volume 2, p. 250).

¹⁴ nañāḥ paryudāse 'ti. abrāhmaṇa ityādau *only in* O.

asty ubhayaprāptir iti. (16) ubhayaprāptāv iti sūtram tu prāptigrahaṇād
ubhayoḥ kartṛkarmanor yatra sāmārthyaprāptam upādānaṃ tatrai 'va pravartate,³ na
tv anyataraprayoga⁴ iti bhāvaḥ.⁵

saṃbandhaviśeṣa iti.⁶ (4.4) pratipādyapratipādakabhāvaḥ.⁷

śabdāntare 'ti.⁸ (5) nānājātīye⁹ vyākaraṇe satī 'ty arthaḥ.

ata eve 'ti. (8) vācyavācakabhāvasaṃbandhasattvād¹⁰ eve 'ty arthah.

¹¹{**anyahetukam.** (15) arthātmatvahetukam.¹² spaṣṭam cai 'tad
ambarāntadhṛter iti ṛṭīyapādasthasūtre¹³ vācaspatye kalpatarau ca. }

gotve 'ti.¹⁴ (19) arthasaṃbandhitvena smṛtasya śabdasya jñānamātre
viśeṣaṇatvasvīkārād¹⁵ eve 'ty arthaḥ.

¹ ihānupādānād iti US: anupādānād *through* anyataraprayoga iti bhāvaḥ (*following passage*) *om. in P.*

² Above bhāvāḥ *in S* are marks, and *in the margin S* has atrayaḥ kaustubhaḥ taṭṭikā ca asaṃmateti parimāgā (=ṇā?) khyāyām i (*then about 3 akṣaras unclear*) aśvatyāṃ vakṣyāmaḥ. *A reference to P 3.3.20?*

³ pravarttate iti B.

⁴ anyataraprayoge USJ.

⁵ Here E has iti viṣayanirūpaṇā (3.28).

⁶ °viśeṣa iti J: °viśeṣaḥ USE: saṃvādheti P: °viśeṣeti *all others. Prabhā* 18b, 4 (N 22v, 9) *matches P.*

⁷ °bhāvarūpaḥ US: °bhāvasaṃbādhaḥviśeṣa ity arthaḥ J.

⁸ śabdāntaravyāvṛtteti US.

⁹ °jātīyake P: °jātīya US.

¹⁰ bhāva *om. in I.*

¹¹ anyahetukam *through* kalpatarau ca *occurs in* KNRIABTC (*partially in I*); *it is om. in* OPMLYUSEJ (*and in Prabhā*): anyahetukam *through* gotveti (*following passage; see note*) *written in margin in K: I ends after the word anyahetukam.*

¹² tva *om. in C.*

¹³ ṛṭīyapādastha *om. in* KN: °pādasya sūtre R. *Vedāntasūtra* 1.3.10.

¹⁴ gotvastheti O: gotvasyeveti US: ata eveti P. *Prabhā* 20t, 5 (N 24v, 10) *matches P.*

¹⁵ viśeṣaṇasvīkārād B.

¹{**tadabhinne** 'ti. (21) tena dravyenā 'bhinno guṇaḥ ekādhikaraṇatvāt,²
etāvatai 'vā³ 'bhinnatvam. tena guṇenā 'bhinnā kriyā tasyās⁴ tena dravyenā 'bheda
ity arthaḥ.

samasattāke 'ti. (24) samā tulyā sattā sthitir yayor guṇakriyayoḥ bhedasya
ekādhikaraṇatvāt samasattākatvam. tathā 'bhedasyā⁵ 'pi. gavi
dravyatvapṛthivītvayor parasparam bhinnayor jātitvena yo 'bhedas tasyai
'kādhikaraṇatve 'pi dravyatvapṛthivītvayor bheda eve 'ti bhāvaḥ.⁶ }

tapratyaya iti.⁷ (5.16) tatra hi⁸ niṣṭhāyāṃ seṭī 'ti pratyākhyāye⁹ 'ḍāgame
pāṭhītam¹⁰ iti syād ity āśāṅkyā¹¹ ṇer adhyayana¹² ity atra¹³ ṇer iti yogam vibhājya¹⁴

¹ tadabhinne *through* bhāvaḥ (*end of following passage*) *only in O (partially in Prabhā* 20t, 9 (N 25,5)); *in its place P has* bhedābhedau (4.24).

vāstavikatvavyāvahārikatvābhyāṃ.

² °karaṇatvāt *corr.*: °tvātvāt O.

³ etāvatai 'vā *corr.*: etāvatair va O.

⁴ tasyās *corr.*: tesyāḥ O.

⁵ *Here O has a passage which seems to be a repetition of the text, ekādhikaraṇatvāt samasattākatvam. tathā 'bhedasyā. If this is not a mistake, perhaps 'bhedasyā should be corrected to 'bhedasya.*

⁶ Cf. *Prabhā* 20b, 5 (N 25v, 6) samā tulyā anyūnānatiriktā sattā sthitir yayor bhedābhedayos tau tathā guṇakriyayo tadrūpeṇa mithobhedasyātiriktasya tadanyataramātravṛttitvenaikādhikāraṇatvāt samasattākatvā tathā tayor abhedasyāpi evam anyatrāpīti tayor virodhaḥ gavi dravyatvapṛthivītvayor parasparā tatvena bhinnayor jātitvena yo 'bhedas tasyātathātyena dravyatvapṛthivītvayor ūbhayāṅgikāra evam anyatrāpīty arthaḥ.

⁷ ktapratyaya° KRC: tūpratyaya° N (*perhaps a misreading of* kta): bhāṣyarītyā tapratyaya° US. MBh III 203.1-6.

⁸ hi *om. in* MLY.

⁹ niṣṭhāyā iṅ neti vyākhyāye E.

¹⁰ paṭitam B: vāritam M: pāritam LY.

¹¹ āśāṅkyā O.

¹² adhyayane vṛttam MLYS.

¹³ ity atra *om. in* S.

¹⁴ vibhājya O.

nyantān niṣṭhāyā¹ iṅ ne 'ti vyākhyāya tato vṛttam. vṛtter eva² niṣṭhāyām ṇilopo nā
'nyasya. sa cā 'dhyayana eve 'ti siddhāntitam.

etene 'ti.³ (19) upāyānām⁴ avyavasthitatvāt kaṭcaḍādīnām⁵ nānātvēne 'ty
arthah.

śaraṅkīkartavye 'ti.⁶ (6.27) śaktyāśrayatvēne 'tyādiḥ.⁷

⁸{ parampare 'ti. (28) śaktyāśraye⁹ lakārasmāarakatipsmāarakasaṃbandhene
'ty arthah.

vṛttisūnyatvād iti. (29) sāksādbodhakatvābhāvāt.¹⁰ }

varṇasphoṭe 'ti.¹¹ (7.1) etatpakṣe¹² prakṛtipratyayābhyām svasvarūpenā
'rthopasthitih.¹³ padasphoṭa ity atra¹⁴ padaśabdēna sūptiṅantam.¹ atra²

¹ niṣṭayā O: niṣṭāyām PUS.

² evādhyayane J.

³ etena *through* arthah *om. in* J.

⁴ eteno 'pāyānām MLY.

⁵ kaṭcaḍādīnām RAT: kaṭcaḍādīnānām C: kaṭcaṅādīnām B: kaṭcaṭādīnām KN:
avyavasthitakaṭcaḍādīnām E: avyavahitatvāt kaḍcaḍādīnām P: °tvād akaścatādīnām
MLY: °tvāl laṭcaṅādīnām O: °tvāt laṭcaṭādīnām US. Cf. *Sphoṭavāda*, p. 6, l. 2-3,
which has kaṭcaḍābhedaiḥ in a similar passage; Prabhā 23t, 2 (N 29, 1)
avyavasthitatvāl laṭcaḍādīnām.

⁶ śaraṅīti P: ādeśā eva śaraṅkīkartavyā iti US.

⁷ °tvēne ty arthah P: °tvēne vyarthah US (*but vya is probably based on a reading
tya*).

⁸ parāpare 'ti *through* sāksādbodhakatvābhāvāt (*following passage*) *occurs only in
OKBC, and there it is misplaced, being given in C in the middle of the passage on
anāvaśyake 'ti (7.24 or 23), and in OKB in the middle of the passage on
vyañjakadhvanī 'ti (7.24); see notes below. (The pratīkas occur here in Prabhā* 26t,
7, 8 (N 33v, 2, 3), *but not much else of the text.*)

⁹ śaktyāśraya C.

¹⁰ °katābhāvāt B.

¹¹ varṇasphoṭa ityādi J.

¹² *In place of* etatpakṣe PEJ *have* varṇasphoṭapakṣe: atra pakṣe US: etatpakṣe pi MLY
(°pakṣe tipi L).

¹³ °rūpeṇopasthitih B.

¹⁴ atra tu J. *Perhaps a reference to ŚK* 7.2. *or* 7.13.

prakṛtipratyayābhyām na³ svasvārthopasthitih,⁴ kiṃ tu samudāyena⁵ 'va⁵

samuditasye⁶ 'ti. vasnasādaḥ prakṛtipratyayasam̐mohena⁷ tathā 'vaśyakatvāt.

anāvaśyake 'ti.⁸ (24 or 23?) nanv ānupūrvīviśeṣaviśiṣṭavarṇānām⁹ eva
vyañjakatvam avaśyaṃ¹⁰ vaktavyam. anyathā saro rasa ityādaḥ¹¹

arthaviśeṣapratītyanāpatteh. evaṃ cā 'nupūrvīviśeṣaviśiṣṭānām¹² teṣām eva

vākyatvopapattāv atiriktatalkalpanāsaṃgater iti¹³ vācyam.

saṃniveśaviśeṣaviśiṣṭatantvādīnām¹⁴ eva paṭatvādyupapattāv¹⁵

atiriktatalkalpanānāpatteh.¹⁶ yat tu vākyaśaktigrahe padaśaktigrahaḥ kāraṇaṃ

pratyekapadaśaktigrahābhāve¹⁷ vākyaarthabodhasyā 'jāyamānatvāt

pratyekapadaśaktigrahasattve¹⁸ cā¹ 'pūrvavākyaśravaṇe 'pi² tasya jāyamānatvād iti.

¹ sup *om. in* RAT: suptiñātarūpā J.

² tatra MLJ.

³ na *om. in* ML.

⁴ sva *om. in* O.

⁵ samudāyeneva M.

⁶ samuccitasye AB.

⁷ prakṛti *repeated in* LY.

⁸ anāvaśyakyeti MLY: asmimś ca pakṣadvaye iti US: anāvaśyake 'ti *om. in* PJ.

⁹ na cānupūrvīviśeṣaṇiṣṭhavarṇānām US: nanu ānupūrvīviśeṣaṇaviśiṣṭa° M: nanv ānupūrvāviśiṣṭānām varṇānām J: nanv anupūrvā° E. *Prabhā* 28t, 9 (N 36, 7) na cānupūrvā°.

¹⁰ avaśyā *om. in* MLY.

¹¹ *Here C has the passages parāpare 'ti through śākṣādbodhakatvābhāvāt (two and three passages above); its variant is listed above.*

¹² °viśeṣaṇa° M: viśeṣa *om. in* EJ.

¹³ °kalpanāyā asaṃgater iti MLY: °saṃgateti USE. *Prabhā* 28b, 1 (N 36, 9) °kalpanā 'saṃgatāpratīter aupādhikatvenāpy upapatter iti *in a similar passage.*

¹⁴ °viśiṣṭatvā tantvādīnām MLY: viśeṣa *om. in* J

¹⁵ pathatvopapattau PUS (paṭavo° US): paṭādyutpattau M: paṭatvādyutpattau LY.

¹⁶ tat *om. in* PMLY: °kalpanāya R.

¹⁷ pada *om. in* US.

¹⁸ pratyekapadaśakti° PMLYE: pratyekaśakti° OKNRABTC: pratyekapadanā (=śa) ktigrahe° US (°grehe° S): prayekapadād aśakti° J. Cf. *Prabhā* 28b, 3 (N 36v, 2) tatsattve (*with reference to an earlier pratyekapadaśaktigrahābhāve*).

tan na.³ vākyaśaktyagrahe⁴ tadabhāvād⁵ evā 'dye tadabhāvopapatteḥ.⁶

pratyekapadāśaktigrahe⁷ 'pi⁸ viśiṣṭe⁹ viśiṣṭaśaktigrahe¹⁰ 'pi jāyamānasya bodhasya
tvanmate 'bhāvāpatteś¹¹ ce 'ti yat kiṃ cid etat.¹² pakṣāntaram āha,

asmimś ce 'ti. (23).

vyañjakadhvanī 'ti. (24) vyañjakagataviśeṣopahito¹³ dhvanigataviśeṣopahitaś
ce 'ty¹⁴ arthaḥ. ayam bhāvaḥ. tattadvarṇavyañjakatvenā
'bhimatavāyusamyoganiṣṭhatattadvarṇajanakatāvachchedakavaijātyam¹⁵ ādāyai¹⁶ 'vo
'dāttānudāttādivyavahāravat¹⁷ katvādivyavahāro 'pi. evaṃ ca
vyañjakaniṣṭhavaijātyam¹⁸ eva paraṃparāsaṃbandhena¹⁹ sphoṭavṛttikatvādi

¹ cānu B.

² °śravaṇe cāpi MLY.

³ tatrā US.

⁴ vākyaśaktyagrahe OPRTCUSEJ: °śaktigrahe KN (a *added in margin in K*):
°śaktigrahe ABMLY. *Prabhā* 28b, 4 (N 36v, 2) *matches O etc.*

⁵ padabhāvād M.

⁶ Cf. *Sphoṭavāda*, p. 30, l. 6 to p. 31, l. 2 (*section 24*); *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntamañjuṣā*,
p. 283, ll. 17-20.

⁷ °padā° OPKRTCEJ (*in K I think the length is added*): °pada° NBAMLYUS. Cf.
Prabhā 28b, 4 (N 36v, 3) pratyekapadaśaktigrahābhāve (kti *omitted in N*).

⁸ pi *om. in P*

⁹ viśiṣṭe *repeated in B*.

¹⁰ śakti *om. in A*.

¹¹ bhāvād ukteś ML: bodhasya satvamate bhāvād ukteś Y.

¹² *Here Prabhā* 28b, 6 (N 36v, 6) *has* paraḥ śākte ekatveti (7.16). *Then at 29t*, 1 (N
37, 3) *Prabhā has* pakṣāntaram āha asmimś ceti.

¹³ gataviśeṣopahito *om. in P*.

¹⁴ °hitaś ced ity B: °viśeṣaś cety US.

¹⁵ bhimatā vāyu° B: saṃyoga *om. in E*.

¹⁶ ādāye R.

¹⁷ vodāttānudāttavyava° MLY: vodāttānudāttādivyājakavyava° US.

¹⁸ vyājakā° US.

¹⁹ parāparā *om. in LY*.

bodhyam.¹ tādṛśasaṃbandha eva ca² katvādigrahe prakāratāvachedakatayā bhāsatē.
 sa eva cā 'sya vṛttiniyāmaka iti nā 'tiprasaṅgaḥ. tasya cā 'bhivyañjakā nānājātīyā
 vāyusaṃyogāḥ. tatra³ tattadvāyusaṃyogābhivyaktasphoṭānām abhivyakteḥ
 kṣaṇikatve⁴ 'pi pūrvapūrvasaṃskārasahakṛtasrotreṇa⁵ varṇasamudāyagrahaṇavad⁶
 eva grahaṇam. bodhakāraṇatāvachedakam⁷ ca ghatvenā⁸
 'bhivyaktasphoṭāvyavahitottaratvenā⁹ 'bhivyaktasphoṭatvam¹⁰ eva pareṣām ivā
 'smākam api. tadarthaṃ¹¹ jñāpakatvajñānam api caramavaijātyaviśiṣṭasphoṭaśravaṇa
 eve 'ty ekavarṇavikalāśravaṇe na bodhāpattiḥ.¹² yad vā. varṇagrahaṇe
 'nubhavasiddhagrhyamāṇatattaddhvaniniṣṭhavaijātyam eva paraṃparayā katvādi.¹³
 sa ca nityaḥ.¹⁴ utpattipratītiḥ¹⁵ tu vyañjakaniṣṭhāyā dhvaniniṣṭhāyā vo 'tpatteḥ
 paraṃparayā varṇavṛttes¹⁶ tām ādāya. sāksātsaṃbandhāmśe tu¹⁷ lāghavād

¹ °katvād iti bodhyam A: °katvādi vodhye B: °vṛttir a N. *Here OK have the two passages given in the text above on p. 6, parāpare 'ti (6.28) through sāksādbodhakatvābhāvāt; in B this occurs slightly earlier, between sphoṭavṛtti and katvādi vodhye.*

² eva vāca B.

³ tatra *om. in MLY. Cf. Sphoṭovāda, pp. 82, l. 8, to 83, l. 4.*

⁴ lākṣaṇikatve PJ.

⁵ *One pūrva om. in MLY: pūrvapūrvā° S.*

⁶ vā samudāya° MLY.

⁷ °kāraṇāva° MLY.

⁸ ghaṭatvenā YUS.

⁹ bhivyaktisphoṭā° LY.

¹⁰ spho *om. in MLY: °sphoṭam KN.*

¹¹ tadartha PUSEJ.

¹² ekavarṇa° ARTCPUSJ (ekarṇa° P): °varṇaviśiṣṭakaśra° MLY: °varṇavikāraśra° E : na vādāpattiḥ B: na vodhopapattiḥ KN: °śravaṇe dhāpapatih O. *Prabhā* 29t, 10 (N 37v, 3) *matches A etc.*

¹³ °ādih PJ.

¹⁴ sa tv anityaḥ US.

¹⁵ vyutpatti° M.

¹⁶ varṇavivṛttes LY.

¹⁷ °saṃbādhe tu J: tu *om. in MLY.*

bhramatvam.¹ na cai 'vaṃ kakāraṭākārayor aikyāpattir² bhinnapratītyanāpattiś ce 'ti
vācyam. vyañjakaviśiṣṭayor bhedena³ doṣābhāvāt. viśeṣyāṃśam⁴ ādāyā⁵ 'bhedas tv
iṣṭa⁶ eva. tad āha,

ata eve 'ti. (27).

yathā ve 'ti. (29) ayam cā⁷ 'khaṇḍapadasphoṭapakṣe⁸ drṣṭāntaḥ. tatra hy⁹
ekākṣarapadeṣv anubhūtakatvāder¹⁰ anyatrā 'ropa iti tadbhāvaḥ.¹¹ nanv evaṃ¹²
vāyusaṃyogeṣv¹³ eva katvādikam astu. tasya ca¹⁴ vijātīyasyā 'stu śravaṇam.¹⁵

yad vā. dhvaniniṣṭham¹⁶ eva katvādikam teṣāṃ eva¹⁷ vācakatā 'stu mā 'stv
atiriktaḥ¹⁸ sphoṭa ity ata¹⁹ āha,

jātī 'ti.²⁰ (8.6).

¹ samatvā B.

² caivā ghakāraṭākārayor° J: °ṭakārayaur eva cāpattir O: °āpattiḥ J; *then*
bhinnapratītyanāpattiś ce 'ti vācyam *om. in J.*

³ bhedane P: bhedenā J.

⁴ viśiṣyāṃśam J: °āṃśabhedam M.

⁵ ādāya BMLY.

⁶ bhedaḥ spaṣṭa B. Cf. *Sphoṭavāda*, p. 91, ll. 3-6.

⁷ cā *om. in J.*

⁸ khāḍapadasphoṭe P: khāḍasphoṭe US: khaṇḍasphoṭapakṣe MY.

⁹ tatrāha MLY.

¹⁰ anudbhūta° E: °ādir KN.

¹¹ tad *om. in MLY, and in margin in A.*

¹² na caivā MLY.

¹³ °yogepy O.

¹⁴ ca *om. in MLY.*

¹⁵ śravaṇā BCMLY: śrāvaṇā OPKNRATUSEJ (śrāvaṇam U). *Prabhā* 31t, 2 (N 39v,
6) *matches B etc. in a parallel passage.*

¹⁶ *One ni om. in Y.*

¹⁷ katvādikā teṣāṃ eva *om. in LY.*

¹⁸ atirikta MLYUSEJ.

¹⁹ ata *om. in RC.*

²⁰ jātisphoṭavādinās tv iti US (°vādinavādinās° S).

¹{ tac co 'pādhirūpaṃ iti. (8) upādhe rūpaṃ svarūpaṃ,² vyāvartakam
avacchedakam.

paraṃpare 'ti. (8) kramāśrayavarṇavṛttitvaṃ saṃbandhaḥ.³ } ayaṃ bhāvaḥ.
bahūnāṃ varṇānāṃ vācakatve varṇasamudāyarūpapadavākyayos tadatiriktayor vā
tattve gauravāt tadgatā jātir eva. tathā⁴ tatra⁵ varṇagatā jātiḥ. rāmāye 'tyādau
rākārottaramatvataduttarayativādi śaktatāvachchedakatayā⁶ parābhimatam.⁷ tathā⁸
ghaṭene 'ti⁹ padagatā ghottaraṭatvataduttaranatvādirūpā¹⁰ tadavacchedakatayā
'bhimatā. evaṃ vākyavṛttir¹¹ apī 'ti.

nityeṣv iti.¹² (21) atra¹³ nityatvaṃ vyākaraṇāniṣpādyatvam¹⁴ eva. na tu
kaṅṭhatālvādyabhighāteno¹⁵ 'tpādyatvābhāvaḥ. ata evā 'napāyopajanavikāribhir iti

¹ tac co *through* saṃbandhaḥ (*next passage*) occurs in OKNRABTC (*in T this passage is an insertion*); it is om. in PMLYUSEJ (*and in Prabhā*); tac co om. here in O (*see below*).

² rūpasvarūpā B: svarūpa R.

³ Here O has tac co. See note above.

⁴ eva prāyā B.

⁵ atra P.

⁶ rākārottaramatvatad° AJT: rākārottaramātvad° B: rākārottaramatvā tad°
OPKNRCUSMLYE.

⁷ parā om. in J: °mate B: °mata| E. Cf. *Prabhā* 31b, 1 (N 40, 7) tadgatā jātir eva tathā
tatra varṇagatā jāti rāmāyetyādau rottarātvamottarātvādirūpā
śaktatā(m)vachchedakatayā parābhimatā.

⁸ tathā PABRTCUSEJ: yathā OKNMLY.

⁹ ghatveneti MLY (ghatvaneti M).

¹⁰ °ṭatvataduttara° PKNARTCUSEJ (*and na om. in E*): °ṭatvāditaduttara° O:
padānugatā ghottaraṭatvataduttara° B: padagatāyā ghottaratvāditaduttara° MLY.
Cf. *Prabhā* 31b, 2 (N 40, 8) tathā ghaṭenetyādripagatā
ghottaraṭatvataduttaranatvādirūpā.

¹¹ vākyāvṛttir K.

¹² nityeṣu śabdeṣv iti US.

¹³ tra om. in M.

¹⁴ vyākaraṇa° BKN: vyākaraṇa° O (*possibly an intended correction of ṇa to nā*):
vyākaraṇādiniṣ° L (M and Y had this, then di deleted).

¹⁵ karna° M.

bhāṣye¹ taccheṣaḥ saṃgacchate. na ve 'ti sūtre bhāṣye² tathai 'vo

'pakramopasaṃhārābhyāṃ³ lābhāc ca.

āhur iti.⁴ (27) ete ca pakṣabhedā⁵ boddhṛbhedene⁶ 'ti tattvam.

varṇasphoṭe 'ti.⁷ (9.2) śabdāntaram⁸ samudāyaṃ pratipadyata⁹ ity anena varṇasphoṭaḥ, samudāyatvokteḥ.¹⁰ etayā 'nupūrvyā 'yaṃ¹¹ śabdāntaram upadiśatī¹² 'ty anena dvitīyaḥ. tat tu kaiyaṭena nityaśabdanaye¹³ 'khaṇḍāḥ śabdā¹⁴ varṇavad anarthakopalabhyamānāvayavā ityādy uktam tad atratyadvitīyapakṣe.¹⁵ na tu¹⁶ nityaśabde 'vayavā na santy eve 'ty¹⁷ abhiprāyeṇa. tatrā 'vayavaśabdena ca¹⁸ prakṛtipratyayādirūpā¹⁹ ity arthaḥ. na tu²⁰ varṇā api na²¹ santī 'ti tasyā 'rthaḥ,

¹ bhāṣye *om. in* PJ. MBh III 420.21.

² bhāṣye *om. in* J.

³ °kramasaṃ° B.

⁴ āhur iti *through* tattvam *om. in* PC: *in place of* āhur iti E *has* cāhur iti.

⁵ etā ca pakṣabhedā B: °bhedo US: ete ca pakṣā J.

⁶ bodha° MLYUS.

⁷ varṇeti P: varṇasphoṭapadasphoṭāv (ov S) uktāv iti EUS: varṇasphoṭapadasphoṭāv iti J.

⁸ ṃ *om. in* P.

⁹ pratipadyāta US. MBh I 113.12.

¹⁰ saṃmudāyatvenokteḥ P: samudāyatvoktaḥ N.

¹¹ °pūrvyā iyā M: °pūrvyātha E.

¹² MBh I 113.14.

¹³ °śabdapratipattaye ON (*in* K *naye is a correction from* pratipattaye).

¹⁴ 'khāḍaśabdāḥ J.

¹⁵ atra dvi° YUS.

¹⁶ nanu MLYJ.

¹⁷ vayavās santīty M: vayavas sa santīty LY: na saṃty B.

¹⁸ tatra cāvayavaśabdena MLY. *Prabhā* 33t, 2 (N 42v, 1) tatra cāvayavaśabdasya.

¹⁹ °pratyayarūpā MLY: °pratyayādikarūpā J.

²⁰ nanu J.

²¹ na *occurs in* OPUSEJ (*and in a similar sentence in* *Prabhā* 33t, 3 (N 42v, 2)): na *om. in* KNRABTCMLY.

mānābhāvāt. ata eva varṇavad iti dr̥ṣṭāntaḥ saṃgacchate. varṇā

yathopalabhyamānāvayavā¹ eva na tu² vastugatyā vidyamānāvayavā iti tadarthaḥ.³

pūrvapūrvopamarde 'ti.⁴ (15) pūrvapūrvaboddhrapekṣayo⁵

'ttarottarabodhdhus⁶ tattadvyāpakabodhṛvṛttidharmāśrayatvād⁷ iti bhāvaḥ.

yad vā. ākāṅkṣādinā saṃsargalābha⁸ iti varṇasphoṭapadasphoṭavādinor⁹

matam. tadupamardakatvaṃ vākyasphoṭasya saṃsargasya¹⁰ vākyāśakyatvam¹¹ iti

tanmatāt.¹² tadupapattiś cā 'nyatra¹³ sphuṭā.¹⁴

¹⁵{**āvāpodvāpābhyām iti.** (17) padāntaroccarāṇam āvāpaḥ.

pūrvavidyamānapadatyāga udvāpaḥ. }

durupapādataye 'ti.¹⁶ (20) na cai 'tadr̥śaviṣaye sthānina evo 'pasthāpakāḥ,¹⁷

vyākaraṇabhedena sthāninām ananugame¹⁸ 'pi na doṣaḥ, smārakānanugamasyā

¹ yathopalabhyamānā MLY.

² eva nu O: tu *om. in J.*

³ ity arthaḥ P.

⁴ pūrvapūrvopamarde ti O: pūrva *om. in KNRABTCMLY:* upamardene 'ti P:

°mardene ti USJ: pūrvapūrve ti E.

⁵ °bodhāpekṣayo B

⁶ °bodhās MLY.

⁷ tat *om. in S:* vyāpaka *om. in P:* °bodhavṛttir° C.

⁸ °lābhā P.

⁹ °vādināṃ BM.

¹⁰ °sphoṭasyāsaṃ° J: °sphoṭasya nisargasya AT.

¹¹ vā śakyatvam J: °śaktatvam OKN.

¹² °mānāt P.

¹³ cātra MLY: °pattis tv anyatra US: tra *om. in J.*

¹⁴ *Prabhā*, 34t, 1 (N 43v, 8) *concludes this passage with the same remark.*

¹⁵ āvāpodvāpābhyām *through* udvāpaḥ *only in O (and Prabhā 34t, 4 (N 44, 1)).*

¹⁶ durupapādatayeti PE: durupapādeti ABRTC: durupapādatayeti KN:

dārāpapādeti M: dārāpapāder iti LY: vyākaraṇānām kalahe saty avāyavaśaktir

durupapādeti O: avayavaśakter durupapādanayeti J: atra ya śakter dupapādaye ti US.

¹⁷ sthānini na vidhyupa° MLY.

¹⁸ anugame 'pi na doṣaḥ. smārakān *om. in E.*

'doṣatvāt.¹ na hy ekasaṃbandhidarśanenā² 'parasambandhismaraṇe
 pratisambandhy³ anugantum śakyate,⁴ yadā yadviṣayasamskārodbodhas⁵ tasyai 'va
 smaraṇasaṃbhavād⁶ iti vācyam.⁷ anadhītavyākaraṇasya bodhānāpatteḥ.⁸
 śaktibhramād⁹ bodhāṅgīkāre tu varam¹⁰ śaktikalpanam eva nyāyyam ity anyatra
 vistaraḥ.¹¹

jñeya iti.¹² (10.27) pramāṇaparatantrajñāne vidhyasaṃbhavāt¹³

ṣaḍaṅgavedādhyayanaphalatvenai 'vai 'tatkīrtanam¹⁴ ity āhuḥ.

bodhyam iti.¹⁵ (11.20) ata eva rakṣādiprayojanasattve¹⁶ 'pi na

nityatvahāniḥ.¹⁷ na hy aprayojanam¹⁸ nityam. kiṃ tarhi.¹ yadakarāṇe² pratyavāyas

¹ doṣāt AP.

² darśanenā 'parasambandhi *om. in* MLY.

³ pratisambandhy P: pratisamvādhī OKTC (*in* K sam *is added as correction*):
 pratisavādhī R: pratibandhī AMLYJ: pratisamvidhī N: pratisamvadhī US:
 dhismaraṇe pratisamban *om. in* E.

⁴ śakyatve MLY.

⁵ tadviṣaya° KN: °viṣayaka° J: °samskārad° B.

⁶ smaraṇā° N: smaraṇā° S.

⁷ Cf. *Prabhā* 34t, 6 (N 44, 5) na caitādr̥ṣe viṣaye sthāninām upasthāpakā evādeśāḥ
 tathā sati vyākaraṇabhedena sthāninām ananugame pi na doṣaḥ, smāritānanuga (gata
 L) masyādoṣatvāt. na sve (=hy e) kasam̐bādhidarśanenāparasambandhismaraṇe (ṇo
 N) pratisam̐bādhī anugātū śakyate yadā yadviṣayasamskārod (d *om. in* L) bodhas
 tadā tasyaiva smaraṇa (ṇā L) sam̐bhavād iti vācyā.

⁸ bodhānāpatteḥ M.

⁹ śaktikramād P.

¹⁰ varā *om. in* B: parā M.

¹¹ *Prabha* 34t, 9 (N 44, 9) ends a similar passage with anyatra vistaraḥ. Here E has iti
 sphoṭasvarūpavyutpādanā.

¹² adhyeyo jñeya iti iti E: vedo dhyeyo jñeya iti US: ṣaḍāgo vedo 'dhyeyo jñeya iti J.

¹³ vidhyasaṃbhavāt *through* pi na (*following passage*) *om. in* C; °bhāvād ity alā B.

¹⁴ ṣaḍaṅga *om. in* B: phala *om. in* MLY: °tvenaitat° E: °tvenaiva tat° J:

°phalakatvenaivaitatkīrtitam P: °kīrttatvam U: °kārttītvam S.

¹⁵ na ca vodhyam° E.

¹⁶ °ādivacanasattve P.

¹⁷ tva *om. in* J.

¹⁸ na hy atra prayojanā BC.

tad iti³ bhāvaḥ.⁴ na ca⁵ vyākaraṇāvyaṅkr̥tavākyasaṃdarbhasaṃrakṣaṇavad⁶

adhyetrparamparayai 'va padarakṣaṇasyā 'py upapattir ity⁷ ata āha,

saṃbhāvyerann iti. (31).

⁸{**vidher iti.** (12.18) vidher vidhivākyasya sauryaṃ caruṃ nirvaped ity asya
viṣayabhūtāyāṃ vākyaikadeśabhūtanirvaped ity aṃśopāttāyām.⁹}

upakāre 'ti.¹⁰ (18) iyam eva ce 'tikartavyatākāṅkṣe¹¹ 'ty ucyate
kathamityākārā.

mantrā apī 'ti.¹² (24) teṣāṃ apy anyāṅgajātavad¹³ vikṛtau prakṛtito
'tideśenai¹⁴ 'va lābha iti dhyeyam.

prayoga iti.¹ (13.7) yady api vedabhāṣya² oviḥi 'ty asyai³ 'va tad rūpam
iḍabhāvaś⁴ ca⁵ chāndasatvād āgamaśāstrānityatvād⁶ vā mā kampiṣṭā⁷ ity artha⁸ ity

¹ kiṃ tu US. *Prabhā* 39b, 5 (N 52v, 3) *matches* US.

² yadi karaṇe C.

³ tan nityam iti E. *Prabhā* 39b, 5 (N 52v, 3) *matches* E.

⁴ *Here* US *have* rakṣā vedasaṃrakṣaṇam iti (11.30) *and* E *has* tatra rakṣeti.

⁵ *Prabhā* 40b, 3 (N 53v, 6) nanu.

⁶ vyākaraṇa° LYJ: vākya *om. in* A: °vācyā° P: saṃ *om. in* MLY: °sarakṣaṇavad R.

⁷ ity *om. in* MLYJ.

⁸ vidher *through* āśopāttāyām *only in* O (*and Prabhā*).

⁹ Cf. *Prabhā* 42t, 1 (N 55, 10) vaikṛtasya vikṛtiyāgasamvādhinaḥ vidher vidhivākyasya sauryā carū nirvaped ity asya viṣayabhūtāyāṃ vākyaikadeśabhūtanirvaped ity āśopāttāyām ārthābhāvanāyāṃ phalī (phalā L) bhūtasya yāgasya samānapadopāttatvena karaṇatvenānvaya (karaṇatvena karaṇatvenānvaya L) iti bhāvaḥ. Cf. *Taittirīya Saṃhitā* 2.3.2.3; *Maitrāyaṇī Saṃhitā* 2.2.2 (16.1).

¹⁰ upakārākāṃkṣāyām iti USEJ: upakāre 'ti *through* kathamityākārā *om. in* P. Cf. *Prabhā* 42,t 2 (N 55v, 2) upakārākāṃkṣāyām (pa *omitted in* N).

¹¹ iyam eva vyati° N: iyam eveti° J.

¹² mātro apīti B: amantrā apīti M: mātrā iti P: mātrā apy āgam iti USJ.

¹³ apy anyāṅgajāta MLY (°anāṅga° M): apy anyāṅgavad A.

¹⁴ prakṛtiḥ atideśye° LY: °deśye° M.

ity uktam,⁹ vijiraḥ kampanārthatvāya dhātūnām anekārthatvāśrayaṇāpattir¹⁰ iti tadbhāvaḥ,¹¹ tathā 'pi tadapekṣayā chāndasatvādikalpanā garīyasī 'ty āśayaḥ.¹²

karmadhāraye 'ti.¹³ (14) nanu¹⁴ karmadhārayasya laghutvāt saṃdehānupapattir¹⁵ iti cen na. anyapadārthasyā 'gnivāruṇīśabdasya¹⁶ sattvena bahuvrīher¹⁷ api saṃdehasaṃbhavāt.¹⁸ na ca vyākhyānān nirṇayaḥ. pauruṣeye tathā¹⁹ saṃbhave 'py apauruṣeye²⁰ vede 'drṣṭārthaviṣaye tathā 'saṃbhavāt.

niścinoṭī 'ti.²¹ (19) avaiyākaraṇas²² tu viparītāṃ tatpuruṣam evā 'dhyavasyed²³ iti bhāvaḥ.

¹ prayoga iti *corr.*: prayogeti OKNABTCMLY: prayoge iti US: prayogati R: ity asya prayoga iti E: vijir pṛthagbhāva ity asya prayoga iti J: prayoga iti *through* āśayaḥ *om. in P. Prabhā* 43b, 3 (N 57v, 3) prayoga iti.

² veda *in margin in A.*

³ ovījī° N: ovi *om. in LY*: jīvaikyasyai M.

⁴ i *om. in MLY.*

⁵ ca *om. in MLYJ.*

⁶ °śāstrānityatvād ABTCUSEJ: °nityād O: °śāstrasyānityatvād KNMLY: °śāstranityatvād R. *Prabhā* 43,b 4 (N 57v, 4) *matches A etc.*

⁷ °piṣi B.

⁸ ity artha *om. in J.*

⁹ *Bhaṭṭabhāskara's commentary on Taittirīya Saṃhitā* 1.1.4.1.

¹⁰ °ārthatvaśrayaṇāpattir MLY: °ārthatvāpattir US.

¹¹ tadbhavaḥ E: tadāśayaḥ J.

¹² garīyasī grāthakṛto 'bhiprāyaḥ J.

¹³ karmadhārayo yā vahuvrīher veti US; karmadhārayo yam iti EJ: karmadhāraya iti *through* avaiyākaraṇas tu viparītā (*following passage*) *in margin in P.*

¹⁴ nu *om. in C.*

¹⁵ laghutvāt tad evānupa° MLY.

¹⁶ pi vāruṇī° O: gni *om. in B*: sya *om. in BC.*

¹⁷ bahu *om. in MLY.*

¹⁸ saṃdehā° MLY: saṃdeha *om. in S. Prabhā* 44b, 9 (N 59, 8) saṃdehaprasaṃgāt.

¹⁹ tathā saṃbhave 'py apauruṣeye vede 'drṣṭārthaviṣaye *om. in O. No manuscript of VP has ' before drṣṭārthaviṣaye, but Prabhā does* (44b, 9 (N 59, 9)).

²⁰ saṃbhave apauruṣeye ca B.

²¹ vaiyākaraṇo niścinoṭīti US.

²² avaiyākaraṇās O.

²³ evā vyavasyed O.

ha ve 'ti.¹ (14.3) prasiddhau.²

nindāvacaṇād iti. (6) nindā ca śāstrabodhitaviparītoccāraṇena³

pāpasādhanatvāt. ata eva kratvaṅgatvam. anyathā yathāśrute 'py avyaktatvasya⁴

mandoccāraṇena⁵ saṃbhavād⁶ anekārthatvānudhāvanam⁷ aphalaṃ⁸ syāt.

kratvaṅgatā tu na saṃbhavati. na hi krator mandoccāraṇena kiṃ cid⁹

dr̥ṣṭavaiguṇyaṃ¹⁰ bhavati.¹¹

dravyasaṃskāre 'ti.¹² (9) yasya parṇamayī juhūr bhavati na sa pāpaṃ¹³

ślokaṃ śṛṇoti 'ti¹⁴ darśapūrṇamāsaprakaraṇe¹⁵ vākyam.

¹⁶{yarvāṇas tarvāṇa iti. (11) yarvāṇa ity asya yad vā na ity arthaḥ. tarvāṇa

ity asya tad vā na ity arthaḥ. kratvaṅge hi vihitānanuṣṭhānāt pratyavāyaḥ. loke tu

tadabhāvaḥ.

¹ *In place of* ha ve 'ti J *has* te surā iti (14.2) kratau havāśabdaḥ: *in place of* ha ve 'ti prasiddhau nindāvacaṇād iti PUS *have* niṃdā (nidāṃ S) vacanād iti (14.6) ha vā iti prasiddhau.

² prasiddhā MLY.

³ śāstrā° B: na *om. in* P.

⁴ tva *om. in* BRC: pi vaktavyatva° E.

⁵ bhedoccāraṇena B.

⁶ saṃbhavād *through* mandoccāraṇena *om. in* KN.

⁷ °dhāvanam apy M: °dhāvam apy LY.

⁸ viphalam eva E.

⁹ °cāraṇena yat kiṃ cid MLY: cida BUS

¹⁰ *In place of* dr̥ṣṭavaiguṇyā P *has* vaiguṇyam adr̥ṣṭasya.

¹¹ bhavatīti bhāvaḥ J: *Prabhā* 47t, 3 (N 64v, 2) *matches* J. *Here* US *have* ārthavādikam iti (14.9). pratitiṣṭhāti ha vā ya etā rātrīr upayātīty etatpratipādyapratitiṣṭhārūpam ity arthaḥ. rātrīśabdena jyoti gaur ityādivākyotpāditāni sautyāni karmāṇi ucyāte. Cf. *Prabhā* 47t, 10 (N 65, 3) (*but not very close*).

¹² °saṃskāraḥ karmasv iti US (ka *om. in* S).

¹³ juhūn na pāpā M: juhūn na sa pāpā LY.

¹⁴ śṛṇoti S. Cf. *Taittirīya Saṃhitā* 3.5.7.2.

¹⁵ °paurṇamāsakapra° P: °paurṇamāsa° US: °māse E.

¹⁶ yarvāṇas *through* avadheyam (*following passage*) *only in* O (*and partially in* *Prabhā* 47b, 9 (N 66, 4)).

ata eve 'ti. (12) asādhv api vadantas tarvāṇā nāma ṛṣayo babhūvur iti
pratyavāyānutpādanenai 'va vyākhyātā ity avadheyam. }

mantra 'ti.¹ (30) duṣṭaḥ śabda² iti bhāṣyapāṭhaḥ.³ tatrā 'paśabdaprayoge
pratyavāyapratipādanārthe 'yam⁴ śikṣā. svareṇa varṇena vā yo 'nyathābhūto duṣṭaḥ
prayuktaḥ sa mithyā mṛṣe 'ty arthaḥ.⁵ na⁶ kevalam tam artham eva nā 'ha, api tu⁷ sa
vāgvajro yajamānaṃ mārayed ity arthaḥ.⁸

hinastī 'ti. (31) leḍ⁹ ity āhuḥ.¹⁰

tvaṣṭe 'ti.¹¹ (15.5) vṛtreṇā 'rabdha iti kaiyaṭe tu phalarūpahetau vṛtreṇe 'ti¹²
ṭṛtīyā bodhyā.

śātayite 'ti. (6) anena śatruśabdasya kriyāśabdatvaṃ darśayati.
sapatnaparyāyatve hi samāsayor bhedo na syād iti bodhyam.

¹ °ti ke cit tu P: mātro hīna iti 1 kecit tu USE: mātro hīna iti J; *then in place of* duṣṭaḥ
through śikṣā J *has* atra mātraśabdaḥ śabdāmātrapara iti vakṣyate. (See ŚK 15.23).

Prabhā 48t, 7 (N 67, 6) mātro hīna iti. Cf. *Uddyota* 31b-32a.

² duṣṭā śabda O: śabde MLY: duṣṭāḥ śabda US.

³ bhāṣye pāṭhaḥ US. MBh I 2.11.

⁴ °arthā. iyā B: °ārthe iyā C.

⁵ vā yo hīnaḥ prayuktaḥ sa mṛṣā mithyety arthaḥ J: mithyā *om. in* MLY:
mṛṣavyarthaḥ US (*perhaps a misreading of* mṛṣetyarthaḥ).

⁶ na *om. in* LY.

⁷ eva nāha api tu E: eva nāhāpi tu J: artham evāha api tu AKNTML: artham evāhā api
tu OY: evāhāpi tu US: artham āha. api tu BRC: artham anāhāpi tū P. Cf. *Prabhā* 48t,
9 (N 67, 9) (*identical to* J).

⁸ ity arthaḥ *om. in* J.

⁹ loṭ P.

¹⁰ Cf. *Prabhā* 48t, 9 (N 67v, 1) hinastīti leḍ ity kṛṣṇas tan na tatra lepo (=leṭo)
yuktatvepi vyākhyānānaucityasya bhāṣyādivyākhyāyām uktatvāt tad etad
dhvanayann anyathā vyācaṣṭe svareṇety ādinā (14.32).

¹¹ tvaṣṭe 'ti *through* bodhyā *om. in* PUS: kupitas tvaṣṭe 'ti E: *in place of* tvaṣṭe 'ti J
has purā kiletyādi (15.4). iyam ākhyāyikā bhāratādiṣu draṣṭavyā.

¹² vṛtreṇeti hetau A. *Pradīpa*, p. 31a; *Uddyota*, p. 31b.

veda iti.¹ (25) traidhātavīṣṭer² arthavāde³ āpastambaśākhāyām saṃhitāyām arthavādaḥ paṭhyate,⁴ anyatho 'ccāraṇena yāgasya vaiguṇyabodhanāye 'ti. tadvyākhyāyām⁵ bhāṭṭabhāskare spaṣṭam⁶ etat.

ūhitam iti. (25) svecchayā prayujyamānam⁷ ity arthaḥ. na tu⁸ vedapaṭhitamantre⁹ sūryāye 'tyādivad ūho 'yam iti bodhyam.

¹⁰{paryudāsapakṣe 'pi ajapaśabdena japabhinnatatsadrśam chandaḥ. tathā ca yajñakarmanī 'ty anena chandasi nityam ekaśrutir vibhāśāsūtre chandasy eva vikalpavidhānād vyavasthāyā alābhe sāmartyād yajñakarmanī 'ty anivṛttau¹¹ vāśabdena¹² yajñakarmano 'nyatra chandasi vikalpa ity arthalābhe vibhāśāgrahaṇam vyartham ity āśayaḥ. prasajyapraṭiṣedhe tu sarvatro 'hitānūhitāprāpte chandasi yajñakarmany eve 'ti vibhāṣe 'ti vyavasthāsiddhau¹³ tannivṛttaye vibhāśāgrahaṇam iti praśnaḥ. uttaram tv ajapaśabdena mantraḥ tathā ca mantre nityam prāpte

¹ vedeti ORUS: vede paṭhyata iti E: vede pagra (=ṭhya?) māna eve ti J: veda *through* kṣudropadraveṇa (*four passages below*) om. in P.

² traidhātavīṣṭer E: *final r* om. in MLY.

³ Here E has yajurvede. Cf. *Prabhā* 49t, 7 (N 69v, 6) arthavādaprakaraṇe.

⁴ *Taittirīya Saṃhitā* 2.4.12.1.

⁵ tad yathā B.

⁶ sphuṭam MLY: °bhāskareṇa gṛhyam B. *Taittirīya Saṃhitā*, Vol. II.1, p. 319.

⁷ pra om. in J.

⁸ nanu N.

⁹ °pāṭhita° J: °mātra N.

¹⁰ paryudāsa *through* vaiyartham (*end of passage*) only in O (*and Prabhā* 49t, 13 (N 70, 8)).

¹¹ anivṛttau *corr.*: anivṛttā O.

¹² Cf. *Prabhā* 49b, 1 (N 70v, 1) yajñakarmanīty asya padasya nivṛttāv anuvṛttena vāśabdena.

¹³ Cf. *Prabhā* 49b, 2 vyavasthāprāptau; (N 70, 3) vyavasthāpattau.

chandasi vibhāṣe 'ti paryudāsasya viśeṣāpekṣatvena vyavasthālābho 'sty eve 'ti na vaiyarthyam.¹ }

saṃbhavād iti.² (16.8) nanu tvaduktavibhāge³ upātta⁴ chandasī 'ty asya saṃkocakalpanāpekṣayā yajñakarmanī 'ty asyā⁵ 'saṃbandhakalpane⁶ lāghavāt punarvibhāṣāgrahaṇaṃ vyartham⁷ eve 'ty ata āha,

ukte 'ti. (9).

ke cid iti.⁸ (9) atrā 'rucibījaṃ tu vibhāṣā chandasī 'ty atrā 'chandasī 'ti chedāya vibhāṣāgrahaṇaṃ⁹ sarvamata¹⁰ evā 'vaśyakam iti.¹¹ kiṃ ca prasajyapraṭiśedhapakṣe 'pi sāmartyād eva yajñakarmanī 'ty asya nivṛttisiddhau vibhāṣāgraho¹² vyarthaḥ. na co 'hiteṣu¹³ nityam anūhiteṣu ve 'ti vyavasthāsaṃbhavaḥ, karmagrahaṇasāmartyeno 'hitānūhitayor ubhayatrā 'pi¹⁴ yajñakarmanī 'ty etatpravṛtter āvaśyakatvād dharadatteno 'ktatvāc¹⁵ ca. tasmāt

¹ vaiyarthyam *corr.*: vaiyarthya O. *Prabhā* 49b, 9 (N 71, 7) vaiyarthyam.

² asaṃbhavād iti O: grahaṇasaṃbhavād iti E: vibhāṣāgrahaṇasaṃbhavād iti J.

³ °ukte° E. (vibhāge *all mś*).

⁴ upātta OABRTCUSEJ: upāttā KN (*then chan om. in N*): upāttaś MLY. *Prabhā* 50t, 2 (N 72, 4) upāttasya.

⁵ asya KN (*but in a portion of repeated text KN have asyā; see note below*).

⁶ saṃbhavakalpane MLY: *in KN, after kalpa the text nāpekṣayā yajñakarmanīty asyā saṃvādhakalpa is repeated (with asyā in place of asya); this repeated text is given in the margin in K.*

⁷ °grahaṇā kartavyam MLY.

⁸ *Prabhā* 50t, 4 (N 72, 7) *glosses this as Haradatta etc.*

⁹ vibhāṣā° M: vibhāṣā *om. in US.*

¹⁰ sarvamate US: sarvam āta R. *Prabhā* 50t, 4 (N 72, 8) *matches US.*

¹¹ iti *om. in US. Prabhā* 50t, 4 (N 72, 8) *matches US.*

¹² vibhāṣā° MLY.

¹³ *In place of na co 'hiteṣu E has ūhiteṣu.*

¹⁴ °hitayor api B.

¹⁵ °tvañ LY.

kaiyaṭoktaḥ paryudāsapakṣa¹ eva jyāyān. na ca paryudāsapakṣe yajñakarmanī 'ti
 sūtre karmagrahaṇam² vyartham, japādīnām akaraṇatvenā 'karaṇamantratvena³
 sāksāt kratvaṅgamantratvena vā sājātyam mā grāhī 'ti⁴ tatsārthakyāt.⁵ ata eva īṣe tve
 'ti śākhācchedanamantrādāv⁶ apy⁷ ekaśrutir bhavaty eva. keṣāṃ cit traisvaryeṇa
 paṭhanam tu⁸ prāmādikam sūtraviruddham ca. ūheṣu nai 'vai 'kaśrutih.⁹ ūhās¹⁰ ca
 na mantrā¹¹ iti pūrvamīmāṃsā āpastambātratyakaiyaṭa¹² vibhāṣā chandasī 'ti
 sūtrasthaharadattādīnām¹³ sarveṣāṃ saṃmatam eva.¹⁴ indraśatruprastāve¹⁵
 bhaṭṭabhāskarasvaraso¹⁶ 'py evam¹⁷ eve 'ty alaṃ kṣudropadraveṇa.¹⁸

¹ kaiyaṭoktapary° OMLY: kaiyaṭoktapakṣa US. *Prabhā* 50t, 6 (N 72v, 2) *matches* O *etc. Pradīpa*, p. 31a.

² ṃ *om. in* US.

³ vyarthā. apādīnām akaraṇamātratvena B: japādīnām akaraṇenā° E: nā 'karaṇa *om. in* J.

⁴ vā sājātyā mā grāhīti AKNRBTCUSEJ (°grahīti BCUS): vā sājāṃ mājasyam āgrahīti O: vās sāmāñjasyam āhīti MLY. *Prabhā* 50t, 9 (N 72v, 7) *matches* A *etc.*

⁵ tatsāmarthyāt A: tatānarthakyāt MLY.

⁶ śākhā° LY.

⁷ apy *om. in* MLY.

⁸ tu *om. in* MLY.

⁹ °śrutim US.

¹⁰ ūhās MLY.

¹¹ mātro US. *Pradīpa*, p. 31a.

¹² tra *om. in* B: °mīmāṃsāyāṃ āpastāvaḥ. atra° US: °bā iti kaiyaṭa J. *See Śābara on Jaiminisūtra* 2.1.34; *Āpastamba Śrauta Sūtra* 24.1.35; *Pradīpa*, p. 31a.

¹³ sūtrasya° N.

¹⁴ evedā MLY.

¹⁵ iṃdraśatruśabdaprastāve J.

¹⁶ bhagavadbhāskara° B.

¹⁷ evam *om. in* S.

¹⁸ kṣudropadraveṇa *om. in* US: *here* PUS *have* ghi (=vi) bhāṣāṃgrahaṇasaṃbhavād (*in place of this P has* saṃbhavād) iti (ti *om. in* S) (16.8) vinigamanāviraheṇa (vinigamanāviraḥād P) vyāpakatvena ca (ca c P) chādomātragrahaṇāc ceti bhāvaḥ. arthata iti (16.22). tādrśajñānapūrvakānuṣṭhāna eva phalam iti bhāvaḥ.

samāse 'pī ti.¹ (17.2) apinā 'rucir bodhitā. samāsābhāve² bādhakābhāvaḥ.³
 kr̥ṇīyogābhāvāc ca katham̐ gatisam̐jñe⁴ 'ti.
paṭhyanta iti.⁵ (5) tathā ca kāryā⁶ ity ayuktam⁷ iti bhāvaḥ.
satyadeve 'ti.⁸ (18.16) satyena sādhuśabdaprayogākhyena⁹ dīvyati
 vyavaharatī 'ti satyadeva ity arthah.¹⁰
vibhaktayo 'pī 'ti.¹¹ (24) tālu¹² prāpya¹³ prakāśanta ity api¹⁴ bodhyam.¹⁵
sādhutāpatteś ce 'ti. (19.28) kiṃ ca¹⁶ vakṣyamāṇarītyā 'pabhraṃśeṣv api¹⁷
 śaktisvīkāreṇa teṣv apy ativyāptir bodhyā.¹⁸
śaktate 'ti.¹⁹ (32) śaktatvaṃ²⁰ śaktatāvachedakatvaṃ,²¹ śakyatāvachedake
 śakyatvavat śaktatāvachedake¹ 'pi tattvaṃ vā.

¹ gatisamāse° EJ. *Prabhā* 51t, 8 (N 75, 1) agatisamāse pīti.

² samāsa° B.

³ vodhakā° O.

⁴ kathā sam̐gati° T.

⁵ ṣaṣṭhyāta° P.

⁶ MBh I 3.10; ŚK 17.4.

⁷ ity uktam PLY: iti uktam M. *Prabhā* 51t, 13 (N 75v, 2) iti vidhyānarthakyam.

⁸ satyadevo sīti USJ. *Prabhā* 52b, 9 (N 79, 1) *matches* U etc.

⁹ sādhyāśabda° MLY.

¹⁰ vyavaharatī satyadeva° MLY: vyavaharatīty arthah P.

¹¹ śārīrā pāpam ākurvātīti J: vibhaktayo *through* api bodhyam *om. in* P.

¹² tālū US.

¹³ prāpya *om. in* MLY.

¹⁴ iti US.

¹⁵ *Here E has* iti prayojanaprapācaḥ (18.33).

¹⁶ *In place of* sādhutāpatteś ce 'ti kiṃ ca US *have* ḍupacaṣ laḍ ityādīnāṃ sādhutāpatteś cetīdam upalakṣaṇām: *in place of* kiṃ ca J *has* ce na.

¹⁷ ati O.

¹⁸ teṣv api vyāptir° MLY: ativyāpteś ceti US: °vyāptir iti bodhyā J. *Prabhā* 53b, 4 (N 81, 1) teṣv ativyāpter ity api vodhyā.

¹⁹ śaktatāpattāv iti J: śaktatāpatau E: śaktate *through* yathā (*two passages below*) *om. in* P. *Prabhā* 53b, 11 (N 81v, 7) *matches* J.

²⁰ śaktatvā ca MLY.

²¹ śakyatā° USJ.

²{**doṣād iti.** (20.8) doṣas tridhā. īśvarecchāvyatikramarūpaḥ
svaśaktivaikalyarūpo bhramarūpaś ca.³ ādyo gavi aśvaśabdaprayogajanitaḥ. dvitīya
ṛtake Itakaprayogaḥ. tṛtīyo bhramād aśvataryāṃ vaḍave 'ti.

upādhisamkaravad iti. (21) viśeṣatvam upādhiḥ. ākāśakālagataviśeṣatvasya
samkaraḥ. tatsattve 'pi viśeṣatvam upādhir iti yathā.}

jātivīśeṣo ve 'ti.⁴ (26) na ca⁵ krāmikavarṇasamudāyātmakapadasya⁶
yaugapadyāsamḥbhavāt,⁷

anārabdhe tu gośabde⁸ gośabdatvaṃ kathaṃ bhaved⁹
iti nyāyena gopadatvādijātivat sādhutvam api jātir¹⁰ vaktum aśakye 'ti¹¹ vācyam.¹²

paratvād dhibhāva iti.¹³ (21.33) kutsādyavivakṣyāṃ dhibhāvaś caritārthaḥ.
na cā 'ntaraṅgo dhibhāvaḥ, kutsanādyarthasāpekṣatvenā 'kaco bahiraṅgatvāt.

¹ śaktatā° ABTUSEJ: śaktatvā° OKNRCJ: śakyatā° MLY. Cf. *Prabhā* 53b, 11 (N 81v, 8) śaktatāvachedakatvāpattāv ity arthaḥ yad vā śakyatāvachedake śakyatavavat śaktatāvachedake pi tatvā vodhyā.

² doṣād iti *through* iti yathā (*following passage*) *only in O (partially in Prabhā* 54t, 4 (N 82, 9)).

³ bhramarūpaś ca *corr.*: bhramadvayaś ca O. Cf. *Prabhā* 54t, 4 (N 82, 9) bhramarūpaś ca.

⁴ °viśeṣāv iti S: °viśeṣov iti U: °viśeṣa iti J: jātīti P.

⁵ ca *om. in* MLY. Cf. *Sphoṭavāda*, p. 97, l. 5 to 98, l. 1.

⁶ krami° USJ: kramikavarṇasamudāyātmakapada E: °ātmakasya padasya A. *Prabhā* 54t, 11 (N 83, 3) kramikavarṇasamudāyātmakapadapakṣe tasya.

⁷ yaugapadyāṃ sam° US.

⁸ gośabde *om. in* O.

⁹ *Ślokaṅgikā*, p. 526, v. 66ab (*Sphoṭavāda, sūtra* 5), Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series 3.

¹⁰ vat sādhutvam api jātir *om. in* J.

¹¹ vaktū śakyeteti P.

¹² *Here E has* iti sādhutvanirvacanā (21.23).

¹³ *In place of* paratvād dhibhāva iti US *have* bhidhakītyādīti *and* J *has* dhibhāve kṛte iti: iti *om. in* E: paratvād *through* āhuḥ *om. here in* P (*see note below*).

spaṣṭam ce 'dam hujhalbhya iti sūtre kaiyaṭe iti vācyam. aṅgasaṃjñāsāpekṣatvena¹
dhibhāvasyā 'pi samatvāt prakṛtipratyayaviśeṣāpekṣatvāc² ce 'ty āhuḥ.

gauravam iti.³ (22.12) idam⁴ upalakṣaṇam,⁵ vyabhicāro 'pi bodhyaḥ.⁶

vācyam iti.⁷ (21) asya mate vyaktibodho⁸ nirvikalpaka⁹ eva. alakṣyasyā 'pi¹⁰
lakṣyatāvachedakasya śābde¹¹ bhānavad upalakṣaṇatayā śakyatāvachedakajāter¹²
eva vā¹³ prakāratayā bhānam. vyaktiśaktijñānasya tādrśabodhe¹⁴ eva kāraṇatvād¹⁵ ity
āhuḥ.¹⁶

jātiparatve iti.¹⁷ (23.5) jāter viśeṣatve¹⁸ ity arthaḥ.¹⁹

śaktigrahopajīvakam iti.¹ (15) bahuvrīhir² ayam.

¹ °tvenā U.

² °viśeṣasāpekṣatvāc US. *Prabhā* 56b, 3 (N 87v, 9) *matches* US.

³ tāsām vācyatve gauravā US.

⁴ *In place of* idam E *has* gauravam *and* J *has* etad.

⁵ *Here* J *has* tena.

⁶ *The passage* paratvād *through* āhuḥ *om. in* P *above (i.e., the preceding passage) is written in* P *in the margin with a mark to insert it here, the only variant being that* P *has* bhīṃdakīti *in place of* paratvād dhibhāva iti.

⁷ vyaktimātrā tu vācyam iti US: vācyam itīti E: *in place of* vācyam iti J *has* tasmā jātir upalakṣaṇam ityādi (22.20). *Prabhā* 56b, 13 (N 88v, 9) *matches* U.

⁸ *In place of* asya mate vyaktibodho P *has* vyaktivādamate bodho: vyakti *om. in* E: etanmate° US. Cf. *Prabhā* 56b, 13 (N 88v, 10) asya vyaktivādino mate vyaktibodho.
⁹ ka *om. in* BPUS.

¹⁰ alakṣyasyāpi lakṣyasyāpi R: alakṣyāpi C: alakṣye pi US.

¹¹ °chedasya° E: °syā śābdavodhe US.

¹² śaktyatāvachedaka° LY: °chedakā° M.

¹³ *In place of* eva vā E *has* evā: vā *om. in* B. *Prabhā* 57t, 1 (N 89, 1), *lacks* vā *in a similar passage.*

¹⁴ °bodhe PKNRABCTLYUS: °bodha OMEJ. *Prabhā* 57t, 1 (N 89, 1) *matches* P *etc.*

¹⁵ kāraṇatvād PABRTCUSEJ (kāraṇatvād S): kāraṇatvam OKNMLY. Cf. *Prabhā* 57t, 1 (N 89, 2) kāraṇatvād.

¹⁶ iti US.

¹⁷ jātiparatve *through* arthaḥ *om. in* P; *in its place* P *has* prayogeti (23.12?): °paratveti USJ.

¹⁸ jāter viśeṣatve O.

¹⁹ iti tadarthaḥ AT.

prayogasye 'ti.³ (29) kāvyanāṭakādikaṃ tu nā 'tyantaṃ varjitāpaśabdā⁴ iti
na⁵ parigaṇitam.⁶ kāvyadoṣeṣv⁷ apaśabdatvagaṇanam⁸ tu
prakrāntānapabhraṣṭaśabdahāneḥ⁹ prakramabhaṅga evā 'ntarbhavati.¹⁰

pāṭhasāmarthyād iti.¹¹ (32) aproktapratyayāntasyā¹² 'dhyayanārthenā¹³
'nvayāsambhavād iti bhāvaḥ.

kalpasūtre 'ti.¹⁴ (24.18) nirukte 'ti¹⁵ pracuraḥ¹⁶ pāṭhaḥ.

durvārā śaktir iti. (25.17) nirvicikitsaśaktatvapratyayasya bādhaḥ vinā¹⁷
bhramatvakalpanasyā¹⁸ 'yuktatvād ity api bodhyam.¹⁹ lakṣaṇādes tv aprasaṅga²⁰ eva
tasyā²¹ arthāntaraśaktipūrvakatvāt.¹

¹ śaktigrahopajīvakam *through* ayam *om. in* EJ; *in its place* J has sarahasyā iti (23.26). rahasyaśabdenopaniṣadbhāgaḥ smṛtayo vā.

² bahuvrīhiḥ P; *then* ayam prayogasye ti *om. in* P.

³ prayogasya viṣaya ititi E.; etāvān prayogasya viṣaya iti J: etāvān pa svogaviṣaya iti US.

⁴ *In place of* varjitāpaśabdā US *have* apaśabdavarjitam.

⁵ na *om. in* LY.

⁶ *Here* J has kvacitayor apaśabdatvarūpadoṣasya guṇatvāt yathā kvāsi he subhru iti bhāṭṭīśloka subhru ity anena rāmasyātyātaśokadyotanā. *Bhāṭṭikāvya* 6.11c.

⁷ kāvyadoṣeṣv BC.

⁸ tva *om. in* PJ.

⁹ bhraṣṭa *om. in* US: °śabdatvahāneḥ J.

¹⁰ pra *om. in* J: bhaṅga *om. in* E: °bhaṅgena vāntar° MLY: °bhavātīty āhuḥ J. *Prabhā* 58b, 8 (N 93, 8) °bhavati iti kecit.

¹¹ pāṭha *om. in* P: ubhayoḥ pāṭha° US: *here* O has proktapratyayasyeti.

¹² aproktapratyayasyā US (aproktā° S): °tasyāpy a J.

¹³ °dhyayanāder nā MLY.

¹⁴ kalpa *through* durvārā (*following passage*) *om. in* P: kalpa *through* pāṭhaḥ *om. in* J.

¹⁵ nirukta E; *then* ti pracuraḥ pāṭhaḥ *om. in* E: nirukte iti US.

¹⁶ ḥ *om. in* BKN.

¹⁷ nā *through* śaktipūrvakatvāt, *and then* iti prathame prathamā *in right margin in* P (f. 4v); *this follows the text from the last line.*

¹⁸ bhramakatva° BC.

¹⁹ api vadāti E.

²⁰ tv atiprasaṅga A: tu prasaṅga M.

²¹ eva asyā US.

Appendix: Manuscripts of the VP which have not been used in preparing the edition

1. Notices of manuscripts listed in Aufrecht but not yet located:²

Bühler, G., *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts contained in the Private Libraries of Gujarāt, Kāthiāvād, Kachchh, Sindh, and Khāndeś*, Fascicle III, Bombay, 1872, p. 22, No. 121 *Viṣamā*, Nāgojibhaṭṭa, 68 leaves, 9 lines, 1908 (age of manuscript), Jayaśankaraśāstrī (pośeśion), Bhuja (place deposited).

A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Private Libraries of the North-Western Provinces, Part II, Allahabad, 1877, p. 110, no., 58, *Śabdakautubhaṭṭikā*, Nāgeśa, 8 leaves, 7 lines, paper, Devanāgarī, Moreśvara (pośeśion), Benares (place of deposit), procurable for copying, recent and incorrect.

Devīprasāda, Paṇḍita, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1888*, Allahabad, 1890, p. 84, Number 43, *Viṣamavyākhyā*, Nāgojibhaṭṭa, 104 pages, 7 lines, 2,000 ślokas, Nāgarī, Country paper, Allahabad (Zila), Paṇḍita Pratāpa Nārāyaṇa.

Devīprasāda, Paṇḍita, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1889*, Allahabad, 1893, p. 66, Number 12, *Viṣamaṭippaṇa*, Nāgeśa, 58 pages, 14 lines, 1,500 ślokas, Nāgarī, Country paper, Partābgarh (Zila), Paṇḍita Lakshmaṇa Prasāda, Old, complete, and correct, procurable for copying.

Kielhorn, F., *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Mś. Existing in the Central Provinces*, Nagpur, 1874, p. 88, No. 65, *Viṣamapadī*, Nāgojibhaṭṭa, 35 leaves, 13 lines, 1100 ślokas, 9 (age) Nagpur (place of deposit), Bhaḍājī Ghāṭe (pośeśion).

2. Notices of manuscripts which have been located, but which I have not yet been able to examine:

A Catalogue of Sanskrit manuscripts in the Punjab University Library, Lahore, Vol. II, 1941, p. 93, No. 1347, *Viṣamapadī*, Nāgeśa, 39 leaves, 1 *adhyāya*, 1 *pāda*. (The *New Catalogus Catalogorum* files list this as incomplete and anonymous).

¹ Here E has apaśa 0 ra (=bda) ḥ (25.34) vāg udyata iti (26.15 (or 27.32)) (*Prabhā* 62t, 11 (N 101v, 2) vāg udyata iti (26.15)). prayujyata iti (28.4?) (cf. *Prabhā* 64t, 8 (N 105v, 5) samudāyavācakā hīti (28.3)). tasmād etat svaravarṇeti. syād etat. svarava (29.27) (cf. *Prabhā* 65t, 13 (N 108v, 1) syād etad iti). *The first of these appears to mark the end of the section which discusses whether apaśabdā are denotative* (25.34).

² As stated above, I have not found Aufrecht's "Oudh IX, 11".

A Descriptive Catalogue of Manuscripts in Mithilā, published by the Bihar and Orissa Research Society, Patna, Vols. I-IV (Vol. I Smṛti, edited by K.P. Jayaswal and A.P. Banerji Sastri (1927), Vol. II Literature, Prosody and Rhetoric, by K.P. Jayaswal (1933), and Vols. III Jyotiḥśāstra, and IV Vedic, by A.P. Banerji Sastri (1937 and 1940)). (The *New Catalogus Catalogorum* files list an anonymous manuscript).

A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts acquired and deposited in the Sanskrit University Library (Sarasvatī Bhavana) Varanasi During the years 1751-1950. Volume X Vyākaraṇa MSS, Varanasi, 1964.

- 1) *Viṣamā* an. fol. 1-5. 10x4.4 (in.); 13 lines; 39 letters; devanāgarī; paper; no date; incomplete. *Śabdakaustubhavyākhyā*. Incomplete. 38984.
- 2) *Śabdakaustubhaviṣamavyākhyā* fol. 1-11; 23-41; 9.9x4.4 (in.); 11 lines; 40 letters; devanāgarī; paper. Incomplete. 38721.

Bibliography

Abhyankar, K.V., and others, eds., *Mīmāṃsādarśanam* (with Śabara's *Bhāṣya*, Kumārila Bhaṭṭa's *Tantravārtika* etc.), Ānandāśrama Sanskrit Series, 97, Poona, 1976-85.

Aufrecht, Theodor, *Catalogus Catalogorum, an Alphabetical Register of Sanskrit Works and Authors*, Parts I-III, F.A. Brockhaus, Leipzig, 1891-1903.

Bali, Suryakant Bali, *Bhattoji Dīkṣita: His Contribution to Sanskrit Grammar*, Munshiram Manoharlal, New Delhi, 1976.

Belvalkar, S.K., *Descriptive Catalogue of the Government Collections of Manuscripts deposited at the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute*, Volume II, Grammar: Part I (Vedic & Pāṇinīya), Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1938.

Belvalkar, S.K., *Systems of Sanskrit Grammar*, (2nd revised edition) Bharatiya Vidya Prakashan, Delhi, 1976.

Bhandarkar, R.G., *Report on the Search for Sanskrit Mś. in the Bombay Presidency During the Year 1882-83*, Bombay 1884.

Bhandarkar, Shridhar R., *A Catalogue of the Collections of Manuscripts deposited in the Deccan College*, Bombay, 1888.

Bühler, G., *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Contained in the Private Libraries of Gujarat, Kāthivāḍ, Kachchh, Sindh, and Khāndeś*, Fascicle III, Bombay, 1872.

A Catalogue of Manuscripts in the Oriental Manuscripts Library (Prācyā Grantha Saṅgraha, now called Scindia Oriental Institute), Ujjain, Vol. II, 1941.

A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Private Libraries of the North-Western Provinces, Part II (sic, for Part I), Allahabad, 1877.

Colebrooke, H.T., "On the *Sanscrit* and *Pracrit* Languages", Asiatic Researches, vol. vii, 1801, pp. 199-231; reprinted in *Essays on the History, Literature, and Religions of Ancient India (Miscellaneous Essays)*, Cosmo Publications, New Delhi, 1977.

Devīprasāda, Paṇḍita, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1888*, Allahabad, 1890.

Devīprasāda, Paṇḍita, *A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts Existing in Oudh Province for the Year 1889*, Allahabad, 1893.

Eggeling, Julius, and others, *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of the India Office*, London, 1887-1935.

Garbe, Richard, ed., *Āpastamba Śrauta Sūtra*, Bibliotheca Indica, Calcutta, 1882-1902; 2nd edition, Munshiram Manoharlal, New Delhi, 1983.

Gode, P.K., "The Relative Chronology of some Works of Nāgojibhaṭṭa Between c. A.D. 1680 and 1750", in *Studies in Indian Literary History*, Vol. III, P.K. Gode Collected Works Publication Committee, Poona, 1956.

Gokhale, Ganeśa Śāstrī, ed., *Paribhāṣenduśekharaḥ* (with Vaidyanātha's *Gadā*), Ānandāśrama Sanskrit Series 72, Poona, 1913.

Joshi (Jośī), Bhārgavaśāstrī, ed., *Patañjali's Vyākaraṇa Mahābhāṣya with Kaiyaṭa's Pradīpa and Nāgeśa's Uddyota*, Vol. 5 (*adhyāya* 6), Nirnaya Sagara Preś, Bombay 1945.

Joshi (Jośī), Bhārgavaśāstrī, ed., *Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣye Navāhnikam* (with Kaiyaṭa's *Pradīpa*, Nāgeśa's *Uddyota*, and Vaidyanātha Pāyaguṇḍe's *Chāyā*), 5th edition, Nirnaya Sagara Preś, Bombay, 1951.

Joshi, Venkatesh Laxman, ed., *Praudhamanoramā with Commentary Śabdaratna*, Volume 1, Deccan College Monograph Series 31, Deccan College, Poona, 1966.

Kane, P.V., *History of Dharmaśāstra*, Vol. I, Part II (revised and enlarged), Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1975.

Kielhorn, F., *A Catalogue of Sanskrit MSS. Existing in the Central Provinces*, Nagpur, 1874.

Kielhorn, F., ed., *The Vyākaraṇa-Mahābhāṣya of Patañjali*; 3rd edition by K.V. Abhyankar, Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1962-72.

Krishnamacharya, V., *Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Adyar Library*, Vol. VI- *Grammar, Prosody and Lexicography*, The Adyar Library, Madras, 1947.

Krishnamacharya, V., ed., *Sphoṭavāda of Nāgeśabhaṭṭa*, The Adya Library and Research Centre, Madras, 1946.

Kuppuswami Sastri, S., *A Triennial Catalogue of Manuscripts Collected During the Triennium 1913-14 to 1915-16 for the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library*, Madras, Volume II, Part 1, Sanskrit A, Madras, 1917.

Nene, Gopāl Śāstrī, and Śrī Mukund Śāstrī Puṅtāmkar, eds., *Śabdakaustubha of Śrī Bhaṭṭojī Dīkshita*, Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series 2, Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series Office, Varanasi, (second edition) 1991.

Oppert, Gustav, *Lists of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Private Libraries in Southern India, Madras*, 1880, 1885.

Peterson, Peter, *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Alwar*, Bombay, 1892.

Raghavan, V., and others, eds., *New Catalogus Catalogorum*, University of Madras, Madras, 1949-; revised ed., 1968-.

Rangacharya, M., *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras, Vol. III Grammar, Lexicography and Prosody*, Madras, 1906.

Śāstrī, Hrishikesa, and Śiva Chandra Gui, *Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of the Calcutta Sanskrit College, Vol. VII, Alaṅkāraḥ, Chandah, Political Science and Lexicography Manuscripts*, Calcutta, 1892-1917.

Schroeder, L. von, ed., *Maitrāyaṇī Saṃhitā*, F.A. Brockhaus, Leipzig, 1881-6.

Sītārāmaśāstrī, ed., *Bṛhacchabdenduśekharaḥ of Nāgeabhaṭṭa*, Parts One to Three, Sarasvatībhavana-Granthamālā 87, Varanasi, 1996-98.

Sontakke, N.S., and T.N. Dharmadhikari, eds., *Taittirīya Saṃhitā* (with the commentaries of Bhaṭṭabhāskara and Sāyaṇa), Vol. I, Vaidika Saṃśodhana Maṇḍala, Poona, 1970; Vols. II etc. edited by Dharmadhikari, T.N., 1972-.

Stein, M.A., *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Raghunath Temple Library of His Highness the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir*, Bombay, 1894,

Śukla, Kālikā Prasāda, *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntamañjuṣā by Nāgeśa Bhaṭṭa*, M.M. Sivakumāraśāstrī Granthamālā, Vol. 3, Sampurnanand Sanskrit Vishvavidyalaya, Varanasi, 1977.